

## INTRODUCTION

### Part 1: Durational Structure

#### I. 1 The foundations of Handel's expansions

The analysis of music has undergone a major transformation over the past few decades, as the boundaries between the disciplines of music theory, musicology, and those of the humanities at large have begun to thin out. No longer can one's analytical study consist exclusively of detailed tonal or durational sketches and descriptions: It must now incorporate a close look at the composition's stylistic, generic, and rhetorical structure if it is to project the work's essence. But so far neither the wide compass nor the sophisticated tools of this emerging pluralism have been able to do justice to the instrumental works of the high Baroque, the music of the period between 1680 and 1740. The complexities of this repertoire remain as daunting today as they were sublime in Handel's and Bach's day.<sup>1</sup> The tentative success of several ecumenical and in some ways quite admirable attempts to shed light on Bach's instrumental works through a study of their style, genre, and social milieu—and the absence of any comparable study of Handel's music—only underlines the need for a new avenue of enquiry, one that is wide enough to encompass both the technical and the interpretative challenge of this music. Only a new analytical approach will enable our understanding of Baroque style to match

---

<sup>1</sup>The period under study obviously extends to the 1750s for Bach, Handel, and other composers who continued to employ a predominantly conservative style.

what we know about the Classical and Romantic styles.<sup>2</sup>

The instrumental works of George Frideric Handel offer a particularly fertile ground for charting a new course of analytical study because they combine some of the best and most idiomatically established source material in the music of the first quarter of the eighteenth century with some of the best and most forward-looking source material in the music of the second quarter of the century.

Little of the material Handel uses is of Handel's own invention, in the sense in which we conceive of the word: Composing from a model and reassembling the foreground in its entirety from a kaleidoscopic array of sources is Handel's customary way of putting masterworks together. Handel's invention, as such, resides in his matchlessly beautiful mixture and remake of prepared music. The rhythmic implications of such repackaging are formidable: To paraphrase Roland Barthes, "Numberless are Handel's rhythms."<sup>3</sup>

The stylistic repercussions of Handel's acquisitive approach are infinite as well: They emanate from a perpetual collision between North German, French, Italian, and English repertoires. Handel culls habitually from styles fundamentally different from his own, and he allows the consequent stylistic mix to generate durational tensions so complex that they cannot always be resolved within the span of any one piece.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>I have in mind Dreyfus 1996 and the various studies by Michael Marrisen cited in the Bibliography. Both scholars' wide-ranging approach to ritornello form has helped shape mine considerably. My reservations about their work have to do above all with the two authors' lack of attention to the larger tonal and durational context of Bach's music. (That Dreyfus engages in conventional anti-Schenkerian harangues is not problematic; it's his reluctance to provide a more attractive alternative that is.)

<sup>3</sup>Barthes 1988/1994: "Numberless are the world's narratives" (p. 94).

<sup>4</sup>Which does not mean they are artistically lacking. In the second part of chapter 5 I focus on the Allegro from Handel's G-minor Concerto Grosso, Op. 6, No. 6, a piece which is based on two incompatible Couperin sources. I show how the Allegro's narrative coherence is charted by the two sources' incompatibility.

Like Bach's instrumental works but in a more popular vein, Handel's incorporate the novelties of their time without compromising the comparatively severe contrapuntal and durational framework of high Baroque style. Unlike Bach's, Handel's do yield—within bounds—to some of the stylistic pressures of their sources. (Their harmonies are sweeter, for instance; their periodicity, on the other hand, is more casual.) When the basic material in these compositions is appropriated from more than one piece and from more than one composer at a time the borrowings assume great analytical significance. Retracing them enables us to pinpoint the stylistic bases of Handel's works and to trace Handel's transformation of them with considerable certainty. We can then go a step further and include the repercussions of Handel's stylistic alterations in our durational analysis.

Although no direct models for the Allemande from Handel's keyboard Suite in F minor, published in 1720, have (as far as I know) been officially identified in the literature, the Allemande's complexities illustrate vividly why a new way of looking at this repertoire is necessary. The Allemande is reproduced in Example 1. The first reprise of the Allemande shows three two-bar groups (bars 1-2, 3-4, and 5-6) that are followed by a two-and-a-half-bar group (bars 7-9<sup>a</sup>), a displaced two-and-a-half-bar sequence (bars 9<sup>b</sup>-11), and a closing two-bar cadential progression (bars 12-13). How do these various groups relate to each other rhythmically, thematically, texturally, or for that matter registrally, structurally, and rhetorically? Is there any reason why the upbeat to bar 12 recoups the upbeat to bar 3, or why the first half of bar 12 amalgamates several features of bar 3 and bar 7 over a fast-moving voice exchange within an apparent F-minor tonic? What is the course of action that prompts the Allemande to progress from the seemingly nondescript arpeggios of bar 1 to the dense and urgent reharmonization of bar 7 in bar 12?<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup>Some passages in the Allemande are certainly borrowed from an earlier Handel Allemande to which I shall turn in chapter 1, and from Couperin's Gigue, "La Milordine"

The traditional analytical methodology available to us cannot answer these questions as thoroughly as we should like because it lacks the tools with which to address either the durational structure of the piece or the stylistic and rhetorical bases of its phrase rhythm. It is these tools that I hope to provide: An analytical apparatus that will enable us to identify and trace the various paces of the composition—the rates at which its thematic, tonal, and grouping structures move at various levels—and a set of analytical procedures that will enable us to trace and to connect the fluctuations of these paces to various types of tonal and thematic expansion. In the later chapters of the dissertation I shall pool these resources and describe how durational expansion, as a procedure and as a compositional strategy, works to secure the composition's rhetorical structure, and how the rhetorical structure ultimately governs the composition's phrase rhythm.

## I.2 The elements of pacing

*The expansion and contraction of pace.* The dual nature of expansion—its simultaneous presence at the foreground as a procedure and at the background as a compositional strategy—is the focus of my study. If the range of topics I cover appears to be wide and at times even disparate, that is because expansion resides about halfway between the resources available to the composer at the surface—the motives, linear progressions, and metrics of the foreground—and the organizing forces that the composer must marshal in order to shape the piece, namely the strategic schemes and plot archetypes of the work's rhetorical structure. Expansion depends on technical resources for its definition and

---

(Ordre 1). Other passages are most probably borrowed in Handel's typical cut-and-paste fashion from a collection of Couperin keyboard pieces, including the Allemande, "La Logivière" (Ordre 5), and the character pieces "L'Étincelante ou la Bontems" and "La Bersan" (Ordre 7).

realization, but the purpose it serves is rarely tonal or temporal alone: There usually is a good structural and rhetorical reason why it takes place.

A central issue to which I return repeatedly is the ever-changing relationship between tonal and durational expansion. I trace the expansion and the contraction of various kinds of pace in order to explain how the durational fluctuations of the composition incorporate corresponding tonal fluctuations, and how they support a characteristic facade of perpetual motion at the surface. The difference between the present study and earlier investigations of phrase rhythm and harmonic rhythm in Baroque style resides in my attempt to combine tonal and durational analysis through the study of pace structures. This methodological union is necessary because the most important attribute of Baroque phrase rhythm, one that has heretofore been little studied, is its fusion of tonal and durational movement. On account of this fusion, I stress the relation between pace enlargement and motivic enlargement: It is through fluctuations in pace that motives take the first step in a series of ever-growing enlargements. These enlargements eventually cross from the realm of the tonal and temporal over to the realm of the narrative and the rhetorical.<sup>6</sup>

*The basic pace.* Several tonal and durational observations about the opening passages from the F-minor Allemande will illustrate in a preliminary way the use to which I put the working tools I just described; see the contrapuntal reductions of bars 1-9<sup>a</sup> in Example 2 (superscripts “<sup>a</sup>” and “<sup>b</sup>” refer to the two halves of the measure). These sketches superimpose a sparse reduction, to a chordal outline, over a reduction that includes figural

---

<sup>6</sup>I have pursued this approach in several publications (Willner 1996b, 1996d, 1998, and 1999). The foundational work on the relation of tonal to rhythmic structure remains Schachter 1976/1999b. Rothstein 1989 and Samarotto 1999a and 1999b offer a similar approach, if without addressing the phenomenon of pace as a central, all-encompassing issue.

movement. The reductions show that the Allemande, like many Baroque compositions, follows what I call the *basic pace*—a steady, largely stepwise movement of the outer voices which becomes apparent when the ornamental diminutions and the figural passagework of the foreground are reduced out. The even progress of the basic pace emerges when the time spans of the essential voice-leading strands are restored to their original, longer or shorter durations through the procedure that has become known as *normalization*.<sup>7</sup>

Since the F-minor Allemande is set in the compound 4/4, its outer voices move at a basic pace of quarter notes, the "official" pace of works in the compound 4/4.<sup>8</sup> This pace is hardly invariable: From time to time the outer voices expand it to a slower movement in half notes and (in one instance) to movement in whole notes; early on they also contract their pace to movement in eighth notes (see Example 2a). In bars 1 and 2, the outer voices establish their essential quarter-note movement; in bar 3, they contract it to movement in eighths; and in bar 4, they expand it to movement in half notes. The expansion serves to accentuate a pivotal half cadence on Eb (the bass Bb on the second is subservient to the expansion, supporting the inner-voice's  $\hat{5}-\hat{6}-\hat{8}$  motion and acting as the upper fifth of the upcoming Eb). Although the earlier arrival of the bass at the local dominant and the brief reduction in thematic activity during the second half of bar 2 suggest a fleeting pace deceleration, the brief caesura they occasion does not qualify as a

---

<sup>7</sup>Normalization allows the longer durations under the surface to reclaim their proper time spans by reducing out the ancillary, subservient voice leading at the surface; see Rothstein 1989. Samarotto 1999b often addresses the equilibrium with which voice leading at the deeper levels of structure moves, and the origins of that notion in Schenker's work; Snarrenberg 1997, pp. 30-35, also provides a valuable account.

Rests are usually assumed to represent the voice leading that is found either to their left or to their right. They are replaced by this voice leading during normalization on a case-by-case basis.

<sup>8</sup>I take up the relation of the simple and the compound 4/4 to the basic pace in chapter 2.

full-fledged expansion: It only serves to set the pace contraction that follows at bar 3 in relief.

Bars 1-4 make up the first phrase and also, it will soon become apparent, the first *ritornello cycle* of the Allemande. As such, they establish a larger pattern of pace contraction and expansion. Let us see how this pattern reasserts itself during the second phrase, in bars 5-9<sup>b</sup>.<sup>9</sup> The task is not exactly simple, since Handel, in his most artful manner, does his best to bridge the thematic and durational boundaries between bars 1-4 and bars 5-9<sup>b</sup>. The pace expansion in bar 4 is prepared by the cessation of contraction and a deceleration to movement in quarter notes on the fourth beat of bar 3. The further deceleration to movement in half notes at the downbeat of bar 4 allows the Allemande's opening upbeat motive,  $c^2-ab^1$ , to recur—expanded—no fewer than three times between the upbeat to bar 4 and the downbeat of bar 5; see the square brackets in the lower level, b, of Example 2. The enlarged half-note progress of the basic pace continues during the rising 5-6 suspension series in bars 5 and 6, and along with it the upbeat motive's expansion continues as well (see, again, the brackets in Example 2b). For the duration of bars 7 and 8, the quarter-note basic pace that had been set up in bars 1 and 2 then resumes. Throughout the eight and a half measures a steady quarter-note tactus prevails through the various pace fluctuations and prevents them from becoming unduly obtrusive: As the basic pace expands and contracts, other paces, which I shall describe in chapter 1, keep the tactus unchanged by stepping in and taking the place of the basic pace temporarily.<sup>10</sup>

An important parallelism between bars 1-4 and bars 5-9<sup>a</sup> emerges just on the basis of these brief observations. The effect of momentary breadth and subsequent

---

<sup>9</sup>I discuss ritornello structures in the Introduction and in chapter 1, phrase structure in chapter 2.

<sup>10</sup>Marshall 1996—an indispensable essay on Bach's tactus—applies in equal measure to Handel's. I'll return to the notion of tactus later on.

foreshortening procured by the semi-cadential caesura in bar 2 and by the ensuing contraction of the basic pace in bar 3 is conjured up again on a larger scale at the corresponding spot in bars 5-9<sup>a</sup>, namely at the turn of bar 7. That is where the upper voice regains the  $ab^2$  of bar 3. At the moment  $ab^2$  is regained, the expanded half-note basic pace in bars 5 and 6 yields to the unexpanded quarter-note basic pace of bars 7 and 8. The ramifications of this parallelism, which I shall discuss in chapters 1 and 4, hold the key to some of the Allemande's most significant durational and rhetorical features. They also establish the wider narrative context in which the enlargement of the upbeat motive,  $c^2-ab^1$ , and the correspondence between the variously paced descents from  $ab^2$  in bars 3 and 7 become issues in the piece.

*The principal grouping pace.* The hidden parallelisms and the hidden contrasts between bars 1-4 and bars 5-9<sup>a</sup> are intensified on a different front, but still within the realm of pacing, by the articulation of the *principal grouping pace* of the piece.<sup>11</sup> The contents and the boundaries of each measure in bars 1-4 set up a measure-for-measure pace on the basis of the patterned recurrence and the patterned replacement of these contents at one-bar intervals. As a clearly differentiated unit of the design, a one-bar grouping pace is characteristic of pieces in compound 4/4 time. Its significance here quickly overrides the significance of the temporary half-bar grouping pace established by the opening theme and by its left-hand imitation in bar 1. And, as it happens, the half-bar grouping pace vanishes after bar 2, when the Allemande begins its developmental discourse.

Like the basic pace, the one-bar grouping pace also undergoes expansion. In bars 5-6 and 7-8, the welded contents of each two-bar group enlarge the grouping pace temporarily to a two-bar pace. The grouping enlargement supports the enlargement of the

---

<sup>11</sup>More simply, one can refer just to a *grouping pace* when context makes it clear that the principal grouping pace is intended.



basic pace to a half-note pace, and it intensifies the dramatic effect of breadth and foreshortening that Handel conjures up at the arrival of the high  $ab^2$  in bar 7. (That the grouping pace does not foreshorten when  $ab^2$  arrives is no impediment, for it has other duties to perform.)

Grouping paces, which depend on the design, are generally much less stable than the basic pace, which—like several associated paces—depends directly on tonal movement. The basic pace, despite many fluctuations, retains its essential identity throughout, while the grouping pace refashions its identity, usually in an expanded state, in the later stages of the piece. Ultimately, these differences outweigh the similarities between the paces because they contribute more substantially to the durational variety of the composition.

### I. 3. Pace, harmonic rhythm, and the literature

*The literature on harmonic rhythm.* The well established notion of harmonic rhythm is closely related to the notion of the basic pace inasmuch as the composition's harmonic rhythm at any given time—and at any given level—reflects the rate at which the most conspicuous changes in the music's chordal outlines take place. The value of harmonic rhythm as an analytical resource is severely limited, however, by difficulties in connecting harmonic rhythm to other compositional features. There are no methodological links with which to connect one's account of the composition's harmonic rhythm to one's account of the composition's voice leading structure. Even though several scholars, spurred in the main by Jan LaRue's important article, "Harmonic Rhythm in the Beethoven Symphonies," have in fact observed the existence of connections between durational and harmonic movement or at least between duration and chordal movement, they have stopped short of synthesizing their observations into theoretical precepts. They could go

no further because the means with which to define the fusion of tonal and durational resources—the tonal rhythm—that marks much of the common-practice repertoire were lacking. Few have examined the structure of the upper voice or its relation to the bass, and even fewer have attended to the deeper levels of structure.<sup>12</sup>

It was probably excessive emphasis on harmonic underpinnings at the expense of other features that prevented theorists from coming to terms with the durational properties of the composition's contrapuntal fabric. The basic pace, which marks the high instrumental style of the early eighteenth century, escaped notice because its durational properties are linear, not chordal or harmonic in origin: Its temporality is sustained by the evenness of the outer voices' stepwise movement, which promotes a steady flow of ever-changing contrapuntal sonorities. If anything, the consequent tonal flexibility keeps the basic pace from assuming a strong harmonic profile. Applied to the music of the high Baroque, a harmonic outlook perforce deemphasizes the linear profile of the outer voices' movement; and consequently overlooks the temporal significance of their fundamentally even progress.

Several recent studies of meter, metrical dissonance, and grouping structures, principally those of Fred Lerdahl and Ray Jackendoff, Roger Graybill, Arnold Feil, and Floyd Grave, have established that groups of measures at the two-bar, four-bar, and even six-bar or eight-bar levels possess rhythmic lives of their own.<sup>13</sup> If their authors did not address the extent to which the purely rhythmic qualities of such grouping may be

---

<sup>12</sup>LaRue 1957 is the scholarly turning point in this chapter of American theory; Piston's foundational work (1941) has also been widely influential. The studies to which I refer are Brannon 1942, Heydenburk 1954, Redwine 1956, Summers 1957, Arlin 1965, Haenselman 1966, Marks 1969, Just 1976, Smith-Daily 1986, London 1990a, Waterhouse 1991, and, more recently, Swain 1998 and 2002. See Willner 1989, p. 166, fn. 16, for a brief account of Piston's legacy, as well as that of Cone 1968. (Brannon 1942, Heydenburk 1954, Summers 1957, and Smith-Daily 1986 were not available for study.)

<sup>13</sup>Feil 1982, 1988, and 1997, L&J 1983, Grave 1995, and Graybill 1994; Feil often invokes Koch 1783-92.

described systematically, that was only because they did not intend to do so. I attempt just such a systematic description here, by tracing the behavior of grouping paces across complete compositions, and by tracing the closely related phenomenon of *grouping modulation*, which facilitates the enlargement of grouping paces vis-à-vis the larger narrative and rhetorical strategies of the piece.<sup>14</sup>

*The literature on pace.* Pace, as such, has received scant attention in the scholarly literature, probably because no means have been found through which to relate patterns of pacing to other stylistic and structural resources. Two quite substantial studies of pace—a book by Lionel Pike and a long article by Ivan Waldbauer—did appear in recent years; if I make little use of them here that is only because they take on repertoires and durational phenomena different from those I tackle. The first, Lionel Pike's *Beethoven, Sibelius, and the "Profound Logic": Studies in Symphonic Analysis*, centers on the relation of pace to nineteenth- and twentieth-century orchestral macrometer (i.e., hypermeter).<sup>15</sup> The second, Ivan Waldbauer's "Riemann's Periodization Revisited and Revised," approaches pace from the perspective of long-span tempo and very broad harmonic rhythm.<sup>16</sup>

*The literature on tactus.* Unlike pace, the notion of *tactus* has received wide scholarly coverage, but mostly in studies of Renaissance music, its notation, and its performance.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup>I offer a preliminary discussion of grouping pace and grouping modulation in Willner 1998.

<sup>15</sup>Pike 1978.

<sup>16</sup>Waldbauer 1989; Berry 1978 attempts a similar approach to Beethoven's instrumental music. Charles M. Joseph's approach to pacing (Joseph 1992) is much broader than mine.

<sup>17</sup>Boone 2000 is doubtless the most comprehensive and persuasive of these.

The role *tactus* plays in maintaining the pulse of Baroque phrase rhythm has more often than not simply been ignored.<sup>18</sup> Early eighteenth-century *tactus* provides the steady beat most Baroque pieces maintain, and it ranges from about 50 to about 80 beats a minute. It is most often represented by the nearly continual movement of quarter notes at the surface or, in faster movements, by the movement of half notes at or just under the surface. In some slow movements it is maintained by eighth notes.<sup>19</sup>

The reason *tactus* has rarely emerged on its own as an issue in the analysis of Baroque music has to do with its isolation from other compositional resources. Unlike the basic pace or even the music's local harmonic rhythm, the *tactus* of the piece does not fluctuate: As a durational component, it is too mechanical to relate to any aspect of the structure or the texture of the piece in any significant way, this despite its prominence as a hallmark of Baroque style. From the perspective of the present study the principal contribution of the *tactus* is the maintenance of a steady beat while the basic pace expands and contracts. Even though the *tactus* does not necessarily coincide with the basic pace, the durational scaffolding it provides allows the faster, more ornamental *figural paces* at the surface to step in and to stand for the basic pace when expansion or contraction take place.

#### I. 4. Topical organization

*Chapter plan and scope.* The dissertation divides into two parts. An introductory group

---

<sup>18</sup>Cone 1968, Lester 1986, and Kramer 1988 are among the few exceptions.

<sup>19</sup>Marshall 1996. Cone 1968 occupies a special place in this miniature history inasmuch as it calls attention to the importance of the beat in defining Baroque style, the measure in defining the Classical style, and the hypermeasure in defining the Romantic style (pp. 68-72). And Pousseur 1966, to which Cone refers, contains beat-by-beat harmonic reductions of Bach that serve as a kind of prototype for my pace reductions; see also Pousseur 1968.

of three chapters surveys the pacing and grouping structures available to Handel and to the Baroque composer at large in relation to form, thematic design, and motivic enlargement at the foreground level (chapter 1) and in relation to norms of periodic grouping and phrase structure in duple and in triple meter (chapters 2 and 3). A group of two analytical chapters then takes up the large-scale expansion of motives, paces, and grouping structures at deeper levels vis-à-vis the strategic and rhetorical patterns commonly found in Handel's solo keyboard music (chapter 4) and in his orchestral works (chapter 5). Beyond the scope of the present study lies the task of addressing the isorhythmic and the developmental aspects of Handel's pacing and thematicism. Although these would seem to possess less in the way of long-range structural significance, they nonetheless play a major role in shaping the progress of Handel's phrase rhythm and in explaining the pragmatic motivation for Handel's copious borrowings. And yet their complexity, and their tangled relation to notions of improvisation and spontaneity, precludes their inclusion here.<sup>20</sup>

Along the same lines, the complexities involved in an account of applying Schenker's reductive voice-leading apparatus to the early eighteenth-century repertoire would detain us too long. Laying them out—the reasons for the prevalence of David Neumeier's three-part *Ursatz*, and for the uneasy relationship between middleground and background—require a separate study.<sup>21</sup> Many of the issues involved should in any case crystallize in the course of the detailed analyses in chapters 1, 4, and 5. (I realize that, in adopting the three-part *Ursatz* liberally, I depart from the strictures of traditional Schenkerian theory. While some readers might prefer to see a stricter adherence to Schenker's orthodox methodology, I feel that the readers' assent to my tonal readings is not a precondition for benefitting from the analytical approach I introduce.)

---

<sup>20</sup>I tackle these issues in "Mozart and the English Suites" (in preparation).

<sup>21</sup>Neumeier 1987b; I present the bases for such a study in Willner 1996a.

Though restricted largely to Handel and to the occasional quote from Bach, Scarlatti, and Couperin, the dissertation's findings can be applied, with some adjustments, to the study of other Baroque composers' music. As I go along I shall explain what those adjustments are.

It might at first appear that the substantial emphasis I place on basic grouping and on metrical displacement at the level of the segment, the subphrase, and the phrase in chapters 2 and 3 is somewhat exaggerated in light of my focus on the larger issues of pacing and compositional strategy in the remaining chapters. It seems to me, though, that one must elucidate fundamental pacing principles and describe basic metrical patterns in the small before going on to consider durational issues in the large. Dealing at some length with matters of surface detail at the outset will, among other things, ensure greater accuracy in parsing more complex pace structures later on, and it will also allow the reader to gain greater familiarity with the new theoretical terms and procedures I introduce. At the same time, it will require the reader to experience firsthand the need to go further and to address more abstract analytical matters. It so happens that this need becomes progressively more acute the harder one tries to grapple with tonal and durational phenomena at the foreground. One quickly finds out that localized solutions can only explain so much.

## II. Rhetorical structure

Many of the new technical terms and procedures I introduce at the outset are indeed intended to address phenomena that occur primarily at the foreground and at the levels of the near middleground. Precisely how they fit into the larger scheme of things can be uncovered by observing the larger narrative and rhetorical patterns that run through the entirety of each piece. My introduction of new tonal and durational tools should

therefore be regarded as a stepping stone to the study of phenomena that fall under the collective rubric of *rhetorical structure*. The rhetorical structure encompasses the composition's hierarchic constellation of narrative discourse, strategic scheme, and plot archetype. It accounts for the temporal sequence of events within the piece, and it provides a concrete and comprehensive means of describing the guiding ideas of the composition. More important, it describes the hierarchy through which these ideas evolve at the various levels of tonal and durational structure. However abstract or conceptual it may appear to be at first sight, the rhetorical structure turns out in the end to hold the key to understanding the articulation of the composition's rhythms, its emergent periodicity, and above all its expansions. Recounting the discourse of the piece in broad rhetorical terms presents us with a simple and practical vocabulary that lays out the music's tangled concatenation of interrelated events in a lucidly tiered and organized manner.<sup>22</sup>

I hasten to add that I use the adjective “rhetorical” rather than the noun “rhetoric” in my nomenclature. It goes without saying that rhetoric and narrative are two different things: Rhetoric has traditionally operated at the service of legal argument, oration and, by extension, narrative; my use of the term “rhetorical structure” does not mean that I

---

<sup>22</sup>I have kept the narrative vocabulary I have coined deliberately simple throughout: In chapters 4 and 5 it will become evident that the most basic archetypal patterns are those that wield the most direct influence on pacing and duration at the foreground.

Newcomb 1983, 1984, 1987, and 1992 remain the foundational studies of musical narrative; Monelle 1992, Almén 1998, and Paley 1998 are the most comprehensive accounts. In the field of literary criticism, Martin 1986 is much the most useful survey, and Chatman 1978 the most engaging comprehensive text. My own approach, largely home-made, is based on a close study of instrumental works by Handel, Bach, Rameau, Telemann, Vivaldi, and Couperin. It bears similarity to that of Barthes 1988/1994 inasmuch as it stresses hierarchy while focusing on expansion. Solomon 1986 and Kramer 1992 present the most persuasive advocacy for simplicity in narrative methodology; Hatten 1994 maintains precisely this kind of general simplicity notwithstanding many compelling complexities. Petty 1995a is the most eloquent of the many Schenkerian studies that have employed a similar approach without calling upon a vocabulary of rhetoric beyond the notion of a guiding idea.

place rhetoric, as such, above plot and narrative in the hierarchy I propose above (as my terminology might perhaps seem to suggest).<sup>23</sup> We must keep in mind, though, that in the study of music the lines between rhetoric and narrative are not very clearly drawn.

Developmental rhetoric is the very stuff that narrative consists of; it is not just a vehicle for articulate narration. The value of any narrative approach to the analysis of music consequently resides in the way the approach reformulates and recombines the hierarchic relationship between the two. This assumption underlies the meaning of my hierarchic nomenclature.<sup>24</sup>

*Levels of rhetoric: Narrative, strategy, and archetype.* The terms *narrative* and *narrative discourse* refer to the chain of transformations which links the various instances of expansion with other types of developmental transformations. They chart the progress of a motive, a theme, a progression, or even a pace or a texture over the span of a complete movement. The term *strategic scheme*, though largely synonymous with the familiar *guiding idea*, is a more comprehensive construct. It denotes the concrete realization of the guiding idea over a long span of time through a broad but specific scheme, and it refers

---

<sup>23</sup>Aristotle 1926/1994 and 1995, as well as Barthes 1988/1994 retain this traditional distinction, as do many writers concerned with historical issues. See the admirable account of the tensions between oral and written rhetoric and between the essence and the performance of rhetoric in McCreless 2002.

My use of the term “rhetorical structure” differs from that of other scholars (for instance Dietrich Bartel’s, in Bartel 1997). How difficult it can be to approach narrative issues from a purely rhetorical perspective can be observed by comparing Mark Evan Bonds’s book, *Wordless Rhetoric* (Bonds 1991), with reviews by Peter A. Hoyt (1994) and Kevin Korsyn (1994).

<sup>24</sup>The components of oration and the theory of musical figures (summarized in Buelow 1973 and McCreless 2002) therefore play no role in the narrative approach I adopt here. I also make little use of the rhetorical analyses of Ursula Kirkendale (1980 and 1982) or Warren Kirkendale (1979 and 1997), or even Peter Williams (1979, 1997, and 2000a). Similarly, I bypass the work of John Irving (1997, 1998, and 2003), highly detailed though it is, and I circumvent the story-telling techniques of Owen Jander (1995).



also to the deployment of the means by which expansion relates to the tonal, durational, and thematic structures of the piece. The *plot archetype* is the broad developmental pattern that the strategic scheme follows.<sup>25</sup>

By definition, the plot archetype shares its basic outline with the outlines of many pieces by many composers of the time. As it happens—and this is where complexities arise—it does not always provide a wholly unitary frame of reference. It may have to compete with other archetypal patterns of development that the composer might invoke deliberately in order to generate compositional friction.

Competing archetypes most often reflect conflicts between the stylistic levels of high, middle, and low; I shall turn to these presently. By way of preliminary example, though, I offer the following scenario: When a chain of enlargements, such as the pace expansions in the F-minor Allemande, has established a straightforward *enlargement archetype* but has run its course halfway through the piece, it will usually be replaced by another, less conspicuous chain whose enlargements had only just begun. If the composition alters its character as a result, a higher, more active *reversal archetype* will emerge that will supersede the enlargement archetype and will probably turn the composition on its head one way or another. It will also echo similar reversals—some temporal, some stylistic—in the character of other Baroque compositions. Textbook notions of affective uniformity to the contrary, such dramatic turns in the basic premise of the piece are by no means uncommon in the instrumental music of Handel and Bach: They embody a stock-in-trade procedure which the two composers took over, deliberately perhaps, from the middle style. This procedure has only rarely been described in the literature.<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup>The plot archetype is a major feature of Newcomb's essays; it has its origins in the Russian and French schools of literary criticism and anthropology. It seems to tie in closely also with Cgatnab 1978 and Brooks 1984. Prince 2003, pp. 73-74, summarizes the phenomenon with great concision.

<sup>26</sup>A good example is the E-minor Allegro for solo clavier from Bach's G-major Violin

Turning to stylistic archetypes, I should like to take note of two: the *troping archetype* and the *elevation archetype*.<sup>27</sup> The troping archetype sees the composer incorporating not just compatible themes but also conflicting stylistic issues and incommensurate dialectical tensions from several sources of borrowings. The composer channels and reifies these tensions in a creative way and exercises artistry as well as invention in recombining and reconciling them (to the extent that they can indeed be reconciled). The elevation archetype prompts the composer to cull the music's source materials from one of the lower styles—say the relatively homophonic middle or "mixed" style, or the emerging galant style—and to transform these sources by altering their character and raising the tonal articulation of their stylistic level to that of the learned style. On account of changes in performing medium as well as cross-national and cross-generic influences, the elevation archetype plays a more significant and more concrete role in guiding compositions through their tangled thematic and durational traversals than one might think. It also maintains a higher rhetorical level than the troping archetype.

*Rhetoric and expansion.* The connection between these archetypes and the tones, figures, and rhythms at the surface is close because each archetype is shaped initially by their moment-to-moment movement. But once the archetype has crystallized, it turns around and shapes the progress of tones and rhythms at the surface.

The connection between large-scale rhetoric and the notion of expansion is an equally close one because expansion is by its very nature a narrative procedure: It transforms a tonal or a durational feature previously stated or implied into something new

---

Sonata, BWV 1019: The expansive filigrees which advance slowly towards the mediant before the double bar are replaced by dissonant, chromatic, and fast-moving voice leading immediately after the double bar. Raymond Monelle (1998) and W. Dean Sutcliffe (2003) are among the few who have commented on such reversals.

<sup>27</sup>Some of my ideas here are indebted to Hatten 1994 and to Dreyfus 1996.

without severing the connection with the old.<sup>28</sup> If anything, the expansion actually underlines the parallelism between the old and the new, however hidden that parallelism might appear to be. Most of the tonal and durational expansions in a Handelian piece enlarge the same original group of tones or a small, highly characterized collection of such groups, despite Handel's ongoing importation of borrowing after borrowing to secure the material for the enlargement proper. A chain (or a complex of chains) of transformational and narrative links between the various expansions subsequently emerges to thread its way through the piece. The rhetorical structure accounts for the progress of each chain and for the internal relations between the complex of chains and the tonal, durational, and motivic structure of the piece.<sup>29</sup>

In the absence of a prefabricated formal mold, such as the standard forms one encounters in later styles, and in the absence of a prefabricated periodic grid, only a rhetorical structure can control and contain the centrifugal impulse of Baroque temporality and Baroque thematicism.<sup>30</sup> This impulse—the tendency of the music's most conspicuous components to develop and expand as far as the limits of the piece will allow and beyond—threatens to remain unchecked on account of the repertoire's limited capacity to organize and to sustain intensification over the span of a long movement. (One must also keep in mind that neither a dynamic nor a textural build-up was available

---

<sup>28</sup>And while plot can be viewed as a stable underlying structure (Aristotle 1995), its execution inevitably calls for as much transformation (especially in what concerns the protagonist's and the antagonist's interaction with their changing environment) as does musical expansion. (Chatman 1978 and Brooks 1984 support such a dynamic approach to plot theory.)

<sup>29</sup>Monelle (1992, p. 237) describes expansion, aptly, as more of a semantic than a syntactic procedure. Grey 1997 and 1998 present the most sensitive account of the analogy between musical narrative and the thread.

<sup>30</sup>There are some similarities as well as subtle differences between my account of centrifugal impulses and Frank Samarotto's (1999b). Samarotto's is more piece-specific, mine is more global and more generic in outlook.

to the Baroque composer.) The centrifugal impulse requires a converse, makeshift system of structural checks and balances—a centripetal impulse, however improvisatory—for its energy to be harnessed and for the composition to evolve in a coherently charted way. It is this ad-hoc system of checks and balances and the consequent centripetal impulse that the rhetorical structure provides. The tradeoff—the unpredictable and sometimes haphazard way in which the foreground's narrative evolves—is a central concern which I shall address in chapters 4 and 5.<sup>31</sup>

*Rhetoric and structure.* From a rhetorical perspective, the study of tonal and durational structure in Baroque instrumental music represents only the first step in retracing the tonal and the durational ideas that each composition seeks to work out. Looking again at the tonal design of the F-minor Allemande (see Example 4; I shall address Example 3 later), we can find plausible tonal explanations for interplay between the repeated descents from  $ab^2$  in bars 3-4, 7-8, and 12 on the one hand and the rising figural activity in the one-line octave on the other in David Neumeyer's elegant formulation of the *three-part Ursatz*.<sup>32</sup> Similarly idiomatic explanations can be found for the behavior of the bass in the first reprise, and for the middleground structure the second reprise as a whole. But only a detailed look at the entire Allemande's strategic scheme—at the hidden links between the Allemande's pace fluctuations and its thematic enlargements—will reveal why it is that the Allemande's first reprise repeatedly seeks to regain  $ab^2$ , and why the second reprise continues to recoup  $ab^2$  as well (cf. bars 19<sup>b</sup>-21, 23<sup>b</sup>-25, and 27-29). One

---

<sup>31</sup>We become increasingly aware that expansion, rather than thematicism as such, is the true agent of narrative discourse. Everett 1996 and Monelle 1992, pp. 247 and 320 suggest ideas along the same lines but couch them in ways very different from mine. Binary opposition, a mainstay of narrative accounts, is prominent also under many different guises, but it is only one part of a much larger and more complex armature.

<sup>32</sup>Neumeyer 1987b.

reason the descents from  $ab^2$  occur so often, to anticipate the analyses in chapters 1 and 4 briefly, is that the strategic pace enlargements governing the Allemande's first reprise run their course during the opening measures of the second reprise, with the introduction of three large, quasi-sequential progressions in bars 14-19. To bring the piece to a coherent close—and to organize the outer voices of the unusually literal reappearance of material from the first reprise during the central stretch of the second reprise—Handel enlists the help of the characteristic descent from  $ab^2$ . He then assigns it the strategic role previously played by the patterned expansions and contractions of the basic pace. (Whether the change is drastic enough for us to invoke the reversal archetype remains to be seen.)

The emergence of more than one narrative thread in the course of a movement is a relatively frequent phenomenon in Baroque instrumental music. Couching its description in rhetorical terms enables us to retrace these threads hierarchically and to order them sequentially in a dramatically logical and expressive way, and it ensures a high degree of intertextual fidelity from a stylistic as well as an analytic perspective. One's interpretation, in other words, is reached not in isolation but in the company of analyses that draw on the confluence of multiple narratives in many challenging pieces.<sup>33</sup>

*Rhetoric, organicism, and counterpoint.* The progressive expansion of basic thematic materials is a hallmark of Handel's instrumental style. While it has the effect of dressing improvisatory practice in the garb of a self-contained, ad hoc organicism, it stems rather from Handel's tendency to push the compositional story line as far away from the composition's basic premise as a convincing presentation will allow. Emblematically, the expansion proper is usually carried out with the help of additional borrowings from new sources. If many Handelian pieces reflect the kind of organic unity we expect to find in

---

<sup>33</sup>The idea of multiple narratives (parallel or not) is common in film theory; see, for instance, Altman 1987, Bordwell 1989, Branigan 1992, and Nelles 1997.

the canonical masterworks of the later repertoires, that is due less to Handel's concern with coherence as such than to the built-in contrapuntal demands of the high style. These represent a tradition of stylistic propriety and authority rooted in North German learned counterpoint, the same tradition that so heavily influenced Bach.<sup>34</sup>

Within this essentially hierarchic stylistic framework, the tightly knit quality of Handel's music can be attributed to the wealth of contrapuntal felicities that marks both its surface and, over longer ranges of time, its linear organization at the higher levels of tonal structure. The great economy of means for which Handel's music is justly celebrated can similarly be traced to Handel's persistent reinvention of thematic material (of whatever origin) through a wide variety of contrapuntal and fugal procedures, and especially through invertible counterpoint. Even though the recondite intricacies of canonic riddles were clearly on their way out at the time—Johann Mattheson's vocal opposition to their density bears this out—the consistency of contrapuntal and thematic expression required by the high style remained Handel's and Bach's preferred *modus operandi*. This meant that every motive, every accompanimental snippet and every thematized linear progression was likely to be recycled at some point in another voice, another part, or another register, in accordance with a "fugal ethic" that favored the continual improvisatory transformation of materials introduced earlier. The frequency with which we find hidden repetitions carried out by voice exchanges and larger exchanges of parts even in the lighter works of both Handel and Bach confirms this observation in ample measure.<sup>35</sup>

---

<sup>34</sup>Yearsley 1994 and 2002 present a brilliant introduction to that tradition; Hatten 1994 stresses the idea that the composers' assumption of the high style implies the invocation of authority. Barthes 1967 and Said 1975 make a similar case for authorial assertion—indeed empowerment—in the field of literature.

<sup>35</sup>Yearsley 1995 and 2002 and Renwick 1995a are the best introductions to the context and mechanics of this rarefied approach. I see no contradiction between Handel's contrapuntal thriftiness and his dependence on borrowings for the source of his counterpoint.

## III. Levels of style

*Stylistic mixture and elevation.* According to Claude Palisca, the characterization of Baroque style as high, middle, and low was imported during the 1730s by Heinrich Bokemeyer from the philosophical writings of Johann Christoph Gottsched.<sup>36</sup> A mainstay of the Roman rhetoricians with distant origins in Greek oratory, the application of the three stylistic divisions to Baroque music seems to have taken hold among writers on music only after Johann Mattheson and Johann Adolph Scheibe commented on it at substantial length, however elliptically or oracularly, in *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* and in *Criticus Musicis*.<sup>37</sup> That the division into high, middle, and low was so quick to strike a responsive chord among enlightened musicians means that it simply put into words something that many musicians and educated listeners must already have sensed on their own for quite some time: Each stylistic level embodied a fundamentally different way of composing, and a discrete durational style in its own right. This distinction, more than anything else, defined the style of early eighteenth-century music.<sup>38</sup>

---

<sup>36</sup>Palisca 1983; see especially pp. 412-13.

<sup>37</sup>Mattheson 1739/1981 is the fundamental eighteenth-century account, Palisca 1983 the basic present-day description. I treat the division into three styles in substantial technical detail, with many further references and a short history, in Willner 2004. Lowe 1998 and 2002 offer good overviews of Scheibe's involvement.

<sup>38</sup>The distinction supplements—indeed overrides—more traditional present-day views, such as the following, from Burrows 1997:

The late Baroque style, as represented by Handel's music, was characterised by an approach to melody and harmony that arose from the cultivation of figured-bass practices; by the employment of chordal continuo realisation in accompaniment, as providing a necessary filling-in of the contemporary harmonic texture; by the formalisation of the expressive power of the human voice (or its equivalent in instrumental music featuring solo violin or oboe), and by structures based on da capo arias, ritornello forms and relatively straightforward binary forms. We look to opera and the concerto as the genres in which these were accommodated, distinguishing Baroque from Renaissance music (p. 141).

The high style—the contrapuntal fabric of Handel's and Bach's major instrumental works—mimics the rigors of first species and fourth species counterpoint. We've just observed how the outer voices of Handel's F-minor Allemande adhere closely to the basic pace, notwithstanding extensive expansion and contraction. The middle style—Vivaldi's "Four Seasons," Telemann's *Musique de table*, and François Couperin's Pièces de clavecin—shows *composite pacing*, which allows the outer voices to pursue the tonal and durational flexibility of fifth species counterpoint on a large scale (Example 5, from a Gavotte by Couperin). The low style encompasses idiomatically descriptive and programmatic pieces with extensive thematic repetitions, bare textures, chordal extensions, and very slow harmonic rhythm. We find it in Johann Kuhnau's light and humorous Biblical Sonatas, and in Couperin's demonstrative theater and battle pieces (Example 6, from a fanfare by Couperin).

It is the middle style that embodies the spirit of mainstream Baroque instrumental music. The middle style is marked by great thematic, rhythmic, and textural freedom, and by an unfettered approach to matters of structural consistency and long-range coherence. Within this overwhelmingly various framework, Handel's and Bach's—and Domenico Scarlatti's—high style is something of an exclusive idiom: Its pursuit of consistency, logic, and coherence runs counter to the prevailing norms of the day.<sup>39</sup> Its maintenance of these ideals in its themes, rhythms, and textures is made possible by its adherence to the contrapuntal progress of the basic pace. And its sustained contrapuntal rigor explains why Schenker's analytical apparatus can be applied so readily to the music of Handel, Bach, and Scarlatti, but somewhat less readily to the music of Telemann or Vivaldi.

Both the middle style and the low style exerted a strong influence on the high style. Just how strong that influence was will become apparent in chapter 5, when I discuss Handel's importation of lower stylistic elements, through his borrowings from

---

<sup>39</sup>Dreyfus 1996, chapter 2.



Couperin, in Op. 6. Here it needs only to be stressed that composing in the middle and the low styles—the craftsmanship of Couperin, Telemann, or Rameau—does not bespeak a lack of control or expertise in harmony, counterpoint, or long-range planning; on the contrary, it requires such expertise in ample measure. But it does allow a more spontaneous and less restrained expression at the surface. The evidence we have across many pages of music suggests, though, that taming the freedom of the lower styles—flexing the reins on their unbridled discourse, and reimagining their happily chaotic rhetoric in respectably contrapuntal fashion—was a major issue that Handel and Bach addressed in almost every piece they composed. There were good reasons, though, why they kept such close contact with styles that were not their own: These had to do less with a desire to show they could do it better (though it was that too) than they did with a practical need to vary the surface of their music as much as possible and to communicate with their audience in terms the audience could understand. Even more important, the music of the lower styles provided a very substantial font of sources for their borrowings.<sup>40</sup>

The mixture of stylistic levels is a source of great compositional friction in the music of Handel and Bach for it presents an intentional imbalance in harmony, counterpoint, texture, duration, and thematic work that the two composers must address in order to satisfy the stringent requirements of the high style. Handel's stylistic mixtures, in particular, often allow this imbalance to stand out because their components—the sources Handel chooses for his borrowings—are in some ways purposely incompatible.<sup>41</sup>

---

<sup>40</sup>Particularly instructive in this regard is Bach's transformation of Couperin's most popular manner in the Courante from the Partita No. 1 in Bb for Clavier; a comparison between Example 6 and Bach's score will disclose quickly what I mean.

<sup>41</sup>For interesting discussions of stylistic mixtures in the Scarlatti sonatas see Sutcliffe 2003, especially chapter 2, “Heteroglossia.”

*National styles and folk idioms.* It should by now be abundantly apparent that the qualitative differences between the high, the middle, and the low styles surpass the idiomatic differences between the Italian, the French, and the German styles in long-range significance. The tasteful conflation of the three national styles accounts for the "mixed style," a species of the middle style that was described most vividly and was promoted most ardently by Johann Joachim Quantz. The basic requirements of Quantz's mixed style, dictated equally by Frederick the Great and the perennially emerging middle class, included a natural, unaffected expression, a relatively simple tonal setting, and a pleasing, essentially vocal approach to thematic work.<sup>42</sup> The mixed style was designed to appeal to the newly cultivated gentleman, to the connoisseur and to the amateur in equal measure. It was most probably the quick acceptance of the mixed style—as a toned-down version of the propulsive spinning of earlier decades—that paved the way for the later, meteoric advent of the galant style, with its broadly sustained harmonies and inflexible metrical grid. But it was not a style Handel or Bach employed very often. The mixed style can be observed most readily in Handel's solo sonatas Op. 1, composed during the mid 1720s, and in Bach's A-minor Suite for clavier, BWV 818, a piece that was dropped, not without reason, from the six French Suites.<sup>43</sup>

An influential but not particularly well documented element of the middle style as well as the mixed style is the two styles' liberal adoption of folk idioms. In his short autobiography, Telemann—equally fluent in virtually any style—was quite explicit about the profound influence that Polish folk music exerted on his instrumental works, and especially on his concertos, whose composition presented him with considerable

---

<sup>42</sup>Quantz 1752/1966.

<sup>43</sup>The most familiar exemplar of this style remains Quantz's own G-major Flute Concerto, QV 5:174, which is frequently played. Handel's mixed style is discussed in Gottlieb 1966. (Bach's BWV 818, incidentally, is supplemented by an alternate version, BWV 818a, that contains important additional material.)

difficulties.<sup>44</sup> Couperin, Rameau, and many other French composers made extensive use of their vast heritage of folk tunes and folk idioms as a matter of course: The soulful strains of mountain songs often run through their airs both as thematic inspirations and, more generally, as a kind of national motto.<sup>45</sup>

For Handel, taking advantage of Couperin's popular vein—or, for that matter, Scarlatti's—was all in a day's work, in just the same way that taking advantage of other composers' Lutheran chorale quotations was.<sup>46</sup> We shall encounter him borrowing from Couperin's most Italianate contrapuntal pieces and from Couperin's most rustic French pieces side by side (chapters 4 and 5), and we shall encounter him borrowing from the most exotic Iberian sonatas of Scarlatti's *Essercizi per gravicembalo* (1738) in Op. 6 (1739; chapters 1 and 5).

*Handel and the galant style.* Handel's relations with the galant style, which began displacing the mixed and the middle styles during the early decades of the eighteenth century, were touchy at best. One of the principal features of the new style—four-square periodicity—simply did not spark Handel's rhythmic invention in the way it inspired Bach's. Only a few of Handel's very early keyboard works, such as the G-major Suite of about 1703, are in any sense periodic.<sup>47</sup> Not even during the 1730s, the decade in which he produced ten pasticcis based on light Neapolitan operas, did Handel take up

---

<sup>44</sup>Koch, K. P., 1976.

<sup>45</sup>Descriptive titles such as "Les Rossignol en Amour," from the fourteenth *Ordre*, bear this out. Sensing perhaps a need to balance popular elements with a more elevated and expressly artful expression, Couperin pursued an explicitly programmatic mixture of French and Italian styles in his chamber works. On the meaning of Couperin's titles see Clark 2002 and Fuller 1990 and 1997.

<sup>46</sup>Roberts 1997.

<sup>47</sup>And it's possible some movements of that Suite are spurious (Best 2001).

symmetrically periodic grouping on a large scale. Handel limited his borrowings from the ten productions to one pastiche, Leonardo Vinci's *Didone Abbandonata*.<sup>48</sup> Handel scholars have concluded, quite rightly, that Handel was wary of the newly fashionable Italianate ways.<sup>49</sup>

The evidence of Handel's uneasy play with on-again, off-again four-bar grouping and four-bar hypermeter reconfirms that Handel incorporated periodicity—along with other hallmarks of the galant style, such as homophonic textures and slow harmonic rhythms—in much the same way he incorporated the diverse elements of any other style, namely within the larger framework of elevated stylistic mixture. On those rare occasions when Handel did require a formal, large-scale periodic framework, he built the periodicity from the ground up, enlarging the periodic grid through the resolution of durational conflicts between dialectical borrowings and incompatible stylistic sources (chapters 1 and 5).<sup>50</sup>

*Handel and "the natural"*. Handel and Bach were under similar pressure—Bach from his fellow musicians in Leipzig, Handel presumably from his audience—to write in a natural, accessible manner, and to display good taste in their compositions.<sup>51</sup> If one follows the

---

<sup>48</sup>Roberts 1986; see also Strohm 1985.

<sup>49</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>50</sup>Handel was just as capable of throwing the periodicity out once it had outlived its usefulness. In the Allegro from the E-minor Concerto Grosso, Op. 6, No. 3, Handel occupies himself for the duration of almost the entire movement with establishing a solid periodic grid (bars 1-56), but he tears it up completely in the course of the remaining phrase because the periodicity has accomplished its tonal tasks (bars 57-68, chapter 5). Only in his last organ concerto (in B $\flat$ , Op. 7, No. 3), completed on New Year's Day, 1750, did Handel adopt something like a genuine, if tentative, periodic grid; see Burrows 1997.

<sup>51</sup>Boomgaarden 1987. See also Palisca 1983, p. 413.

drift of Mattheson's, Quantz's, and Scheibe's remarks one realizes that composing "naturally" was not an easy thing to do. It entailed the projection of a flowing, lyrical way with themes, rhythms, and harmonies, and it curtailed the permissible level of artifice in favor of a studied lack of pretension.<sup>52</sup> Bach in fact did try in earnest to accede to these demands, occasionally maintaining foursquare periodicity at the most unlikely contrapuntal venues in a manner that was quite self-conscious.<sup>53</sup> Handel, by contrast, had it both ways, weaving rich counterpoint and asymmetrical phrase rhythm together into an attractive looking fabric. The significance of this unlikely *mélange* becomes apparent when we consider Handel's mutation of Domenico Scarlatti's dramatically gestural keyboard style in Op. 6.

#### IV. Improvisation

*Improvisation and rhetoric.* Schenkerian analysis lends itself particularly well to tracing one very specific and very important type of narrative—the simulation of improvisation at various levels of structure. A masterwork typically feigns happenstance, describing a course of action in which each event leads to another as if by accident. The composer's sweeping, seemingly unpremeditated manner is made possible by a sure command of tonal structure.<sup>54</sup>

Improvisation is a complex issue, and one I already examined in some detail elsewhere, so I shall not dwell on it at length here.<sup>55</sup> I shall nonetheless try to offer a

---

<sup>52</sup>Dirst 1999.

<sup>53</sup>Yearsley 1994 and 2002.

<sup>54</sup>Suurpää 1997 offers a very useful summary. The major literature on this issue includes Jonas 1967, Laufer 1988, and Rink 1990, 1992, and especially 1993.

<sup>55</sup>Willner 1996b.

sense of how improvisatory threads guide the narrative discourse of Handel's instrumental works as I go along, especially in chapter 4. By its very nature, much of Handel's instrumental music bespeaks improvisation—directly in the organ concertos, which offer both skeletal outlines and notated accounts of Handel's own improvisatory playing style, and indirectly in the many pieces where Handel's habit of composing from a model or from several models at once becomes an act of rarefied improvisation at a higher level of invention.<sup>56</sup>

Because the simulation of improvisation in free composition encompasses a host of different meanings, there are many types of composed improvisation that can narrate a tonal story. Common to all is the effect of spontaneity, a studied pretense of impulsive meandering that bespeaks a virtuoso command of one's craft.<sup>57</sup> It is precisely this type of figural and sequential meandering that spawns the chains of expansive transformations of which I spoke earlier. Each transformation seems to trigger the onset of another, still larger and more elaborate transformation. Within this framework of constant growth, the narratives of progressive enlargement that I describe in chapters 1, 4, and 5 account for the foreground's seeming spontaneity.

It would take us too far afield to examine why composers go to such lengths to feign spontaneity, and why feigned spontaneity translates into a perpetual quest for new sources of borrowings. My feeling is that the isorhythmic quality of Baroque phrase rhythm holds the answer to these questions, and I shall try to give a sense of the complexities involved at the end of chapter 4. But, as I mentioned earlier, a study of

---

<sup>56</sup>There is a venerable tradition of regarding the borrowings merely as Handel's starting point for more inventive improvisations. Dean 1959 has been very influential in promoting this point of view which more recently has come under skeptical scrutiny in light of John H. Roberts's research. Evidently, *everything* Handel composed—even the most improvisatory and developmental passages—is modeled on a borrowing.

<sup>57</sup>Kerman 1994 and 1999 are particularly effective in relating virtuoso abandon to improvisation and spontaneity.

Baroque isorhythm will have to await another occasion.

*Improvisation, expansion, and organicism.* From the practical perspective of enlargement that comes about through improvisation, what sounds to our ears as an organic concern with presenting the same material in an ever changing light in fact embodies a more mundane concern with the need to procure musical matter by modifying and reformulating the same material through the judicious addition of novel and striking invention. That is perhaps why we find in some of Handel's most tightly integrated music instances where each hidden repetition and each enlargement transforms its object of variation not through fresh thematic invention but through the closely controlled incorporation of a new borrowing from a different source (chapter 4). At the deeper levels, of course, there is no contradiction between the inspired freedom of improvisation, and the continual transformation of imported music: It was Schenker himself who showed that improvisation and organicism go together, that each is essential to the well-being of the other. In Handel's music the tension between borrowing, improvisation, and coherence is fundamental. It corresponds most clearly to the synthesis Schenker has in mind when he describes the act of composition:

The presence of mind with which our geniuses mastered the tonal materials of music in so [lofty] a fashion empowered them for the first time to create long-spanning syntheses. Their works are not just scraped together; instead they are sketched out instantaneously in the manner of free fantasy, and are drawn up from a mysterious fundamental source (*Urgrund*).<sup>58</sup>

---

<sup>58</sup>Bent 1986a, pp. 131-32. Though not a major concern of Baroque invention, the issue of organicism remains an important one on account of the simplicity of the tonal system. For all the complexities of figured bass and contrapuntal artifice, even the intricacies of early eighteenth-century instrumental music display a foundational simplicity when reduced to their essentials. The organic masterwork strikes a balance between this

## V. The Nature of Expansion

*Levels of expansion.* When one considers the diversity of the roles that expansion assumes in early eighteenth-century music, one begins to realize what a powerful and versatile compositional resource it is. Expansion operates simultaneously at several levels. Close to the foreground, it is a procedure that promotes the enlargement of the basic pace and the motivic design, especially through sequential or quasi-sequential enlargement.<sup>59</sup> At higher levels it is a strategy, an invention that affects all the resources with which the composition is put together.

Many of the larger Handelian expansions I discuss take place in the middleground and fall in between these two extremes. They also fall somewhere between Schenker's *Dehnung* and his *Vergrößerung*. *Dehnung* stresses the metrical structure and the durational boundaries of the expansion's model, and it preserves the model's underlying metrics throughout the expansion, even if the model is present only by implication. *Vergrößerung* allows for a more flexible relation between model and enlargement: It does not necessarily retain the model's metrics and boundaries, at least not precisely.<sup>60</sup> The expansions I discuss incorporate a bit of both *Dehnung* and *Vergrößerung*. They rarely leave the model's metrics or its durational outlines entirely out of view—an expanded upbeat figure is likely to present the quality of an upbeat writ large—but they add plenty

---

underlying simplicity and the need to procure tonal tension by recasting simple relations and very basic large-scale progressions in artfully complex, improvisatory ways. Hence the close relation between organicism and improvisation, and hence, too, the value of considering the application of organic ideals to Baroque style.

<sup>59</sup>A good example is the expanded half-note movement of the basic pace in bars 5-6 of the F-minor Allemande.

<sup>60</sup>Schenker 1935/1979/2001.



of new material to the model in liberally improvisatory fashion. Inevitably, the more extensive the expansion, the weaker its reflection of the model's temporality.<sup>61</sup>

At these higher levels of structure, expansion often involves the progressive enlargement of motives—by tonal and durational means near the beginning of the composition, and by tonal means alone later on, when the enlargement has become too wide for the composition's durational structure to sustain. The enlargement of the F-minor Allemande's opening upbeat figure,  $c^2-ab^1$ , in bars 4-6 (the square brackets in Example 2) offers vivid illustration of simultaneous tonal and durational enlargements that occur close to the surface near the beginning of the piece. The further augmentation of the upbeat figure in the bass, spanning bars 13-19 (most of it just after the double bar), presents its later and predominantly tonal enlargement at a much higher level (Example 3).<sup>62</sup>

*Expansion and levels of rhetoric.* As a strategic and archetypal ploy within a hierarchic rhetorical framework, expansion can be applied to nonthematic resources. We've already observed that a pacing pattern can be enlarged progressively from segment to segment, from phrase to phrase, and from period to period: The fluctuations of the basic pace during the F-minor Allemande's first reprise grow in just this way. They connect to the progressive enlargement of the upbeat figure  $c^2-ab^1$  and to the descents from  $ab^2$  in bars 3, 7, and 12 through the Allemande's strategic scheme and by its plot archetype.<sup>63</sup>

---

<sup>61</sup>I generally avoid the term elongation, for it is not precise enough to meet the demands of short-breathed periodic hierarchies in the repertoire. Samarotto 1999b puts it to good use; so do, with lesser frequency, Rothstein 1989 and Petty 1995a. The term originates with Kirnberger 1776-79/1982.

<sup>62</sup>Additional brackets in Example 3 show that many smaller enlargements of the upbeat motive are nested within this wide-ranging expansion.

<sup>63</sup>Wayne Petty comments on the relation of motivic enlargement to rhetoric in Petty 1995a, p. 257.

*The literature.* While the literature on expansion has grown considerably in recent years, only a small part of it has dealt with the Baroque repertoire.<sup>64</sup> And although some Handelian expansions did figure prominently in a number of earlier studies, the authors' limited methodological resources precluded a properly detailed consideration of the complexities involved.<sup>65</sup> This is an opportune moment, therefore, to revisit the phenomenon and consider it in some detail.

## VI. Borrowings, style, and analysis

*Borrowings and levels of style.* That I must return to consider other features of Handel's endlessly fascinating borrowings after only a few pages' respite is indicative of the central role the borrowings play in any scholarly investigation of Handel's music. One needs to be aware that even today many Handelians are profoundly uncomfortable with this topic: Doubts about the propriety of the borrowings linger, and personal feelings about their bearing on Handel's artistic legacy and on Handel's moral rectitude run high.<sup>66</sup> Now one could argue that because Handel's instrumental works are finished masterworks they can hold their own as objects of analysis, and that they therefore require no further

---

<sup>64</sup>Botelho 1993 addresses the topic specifically, but I find his hypermetrical approach too sweeping to account persuasively for the details at the surface. The brief observations on Bach's phrase rhythm in Rothstein 1989, especially pp. 136-37, are more helpful.

<sup>65</sup>Flögel 1929, for instance, presents an extreme Riemannian application, eight-bar straightjackets and all. Prout 1889 and 1895 are more musical but not very different: See the highly instructive comparison between Schenker's and Prout's readings of the C-major Prelude from Book I of Bach's Well-Tempered Clavier in Dale 2003, pp. 100-106.

<sup>66</sup>Many scholars share misgivings about the significance of borrowings in general. Again, the reader's assent to my observations on the borrowings is not a precondition to apprehending my approach.

explication in terms of their origins in the music of other composers. But knowledge of a composition's specific thematic origins very often points to the composition's highly significant stylistic origins, and it discloses a network of rhythmic and rhetorical tensions whose repercussions press well beyond the confines of mere thematic appropriation. When Handel draws upon two or more works in different styles and then attempts to reconcile the ensuing tensions by merging these styles through a strategic scheme, the borrowings acquire great analytical importance.

The recent surge in the study of composers' borrowings, reminiscences, and allusions suggests that the phenomenon of multiple and hybrid borrowings—the "allusive web" as it has been called—was by no means a Handelian peculiarity. It was in fact a standard procedure throughout much of the common-practice era.<sup>67</sup> In many instances the clash in styles that attaches to hybrid borrowings presents not only a conflict between diverse modes of composition (say, additive Baroque temporality vs. periodic galant temporality) or incompatible levels of composition (high style vs. low style), but a confrontation between means of expression that are either conventional ("unmarked") or unconventional ("marked").<sup>68</sup> The resolution of such conflicts requires the intervention of inventive strategic schemes and some very large-scale expansions if the tensions between the opposing musical impulses are to be addressed coherently.<sup>69</sup> Handel's strategy—the elevation, amalgamation, and assimilation of the borrowings' diverse stylistic affiliations—resembles closely the rhetorical strategies adopted by later composers. To be sure, there are Handelian borrowings whose confronting stylistic

---

<sup>67</sup>Knapp 1997 goes perhaps farther than anyone ever has and finds that almost every turn of phrase in Brahms is a quote from or an allusion to earlier music. Though short on analytical finesse, many of his observations are nonetheless right on the mark.

<sup>68</sup>Hatten 1994 is the standard introduction to musical markedness.

<sup>69</sup>One might surmise that were Handel not composing in the high style he would not have bothered to resolve such tensions (nor, perhaps, to introduce them in the first place).

affiliations cannot be reconciled; the composition then becomes a kind of allegorical commentary—in tones, rhythms, and textures—on stylistic diversity and stylistic change. In short, access to the borrowings—at least where they generate such developmental friction—is essential to our understanding of the composition's rhetoric.

*Handel and Couperin.* It is sometimes assumed that Handel, for all his interest in matters French, did not borrow directly from French composers, at least not much, even though the Abbé Prévost, during the early decades of the eighteenth century, already claimed to have found Lully borrowings in Handel's music.<sup>70</sup> As it happens, Peter Williams has recently uncovered several noteworthy references to Couperin in the Courante from Handel's A-major Suite (1720), namely references to a series of remarkable ninth chords in the Allemande for two keyboards from Couperin's A-major Ordre, the Ninth of the Pièces de clavecin.<sup>71</sup> Although there is nothing outlandishly exotic about these proto-galant dissonances, they do stand out from amongst the surrounding sonorities, and they are sufficiently rare in Handel's keyboard works (and, for that matter, in Couperin's) to lend credence to this important finding. A closer study of Couperin's Pièces de clavecin and his chamber works, especially "Les Nations" and "Le Parnasse," reveals many sources for Handel's mature keyboard suites (1720), for the Concerti Grossi, Op. 6, and for the Music for the Royal Fireworks. Even Couperin's two early Organ Masses appear to contain some familiar Handelian snippets.

A single example will, I hope, help set the record straight. The Allemande from

---

<sup>70</sup>Cited in Winemiller 1994; see Deutsch 1955, pp. 333-34. Cudworth 1959 and the very similar Baselt 1982 are the most effective introductions to the influence of French music on Handel's style. Best (1997b, pp. 208-9) suggests that Handel never borrowed directly from French composers in his keyboard works. More recently Best has modified his views to allow for the possibility of borrowings, subconscious perhaps, from Couperin in light of the findings presented here (private communication).

<sup>71</sup>Williams 1986.

Handel's E-major Suite is marked by many surprising turns of phrase, by luminously dissonant part writing, and by a vocally suggestive lyricism that relies on a preponderance of deceptive cadences and progressions. The brackets and the asterisks in Example 7 show how all of these features derive, in cut-and-paste fashion, from the *Seconde Partie* of "Les Agréments," a well known movement from the fifth *Ordre* of Couperin's *Pièces*, from the *Allemande*, "La Logivière," which opens the same *Ordre*, and from the *Allemande*, "La Laborieuse," from the second *Ordre*. Note especially how Handel transforms the piquant  $\frac{6}{4}$  chords and the pleasantly astringent, widely spaced chordal sonorities of "Les Agréments" into a more tightly packed series of acerbic sounds (the asterisks in Example 7). We shall see in chapter 4 that the *Allemande* from the D-minor Suite (1720), among Handel's most closely structured instrumental works, derives from various movements in Couperin's second *Ordre* in much the same way.

I should mention at least in passing the influence on Handel of Gottlieb Muffat's *Componimenti musicali*, a set of six keyboard suites composed in Vienna in the mixed style and graced by a heavy French accent. These suites, published in 1738, figure prominently in Handel's Op. 6 and they will occasionally help us unravel the *Concerti Grossi*'s durational intricacies.

## Part 2: Analytical Method

### I. Durational issues.

*Hypermeter and durational reduction.* In several papers about Baroque phrase rhythm I called upon four-bar hypermeter and durational reduction by factors of two and four to illustrate the behavior of pace and expansion over long spans of time.<sup>72</sup> For much of the

---

<sup>72</sup>Willner 1996b, 1998, and 1999.

present dissertation, however, I confine my use of hypermeter and reduction to a two-bar hypermeter and to reduction by a factor of two (and, in some instances of triple meter and triple grouping, to reduction by a factor of one-and-a-half or three). And, in fact, I use durational reduction sparingly, for reasons that will become clear after we take a look at Handel's hypermeter. With the rare exception of those compositions in the compound 4/4 that maintain one-bar grouping throughout, and pieces, such as allemandes and fugues, that maintain uneven patterning as a matter of generic idiom, most of Handel's instrumental works establish a relatively consistent grouping scheme of two-bar segments in the foreground. Such grouping promotes a *de facto* two-bar hypermeter which makes its presence known even in the absence of a formally established periodicity. Example 8, the opening ritornello of the Concerto in B $\flat$  for Harp and Organ, Op. 4, No. 6, shows how the three clearly articulated parts of the ritornello—the *Vordersatz*, *Fortspinnung*, and *Epilog*—occupy two measures each; in so doing they establish a two-bar hypermeter without encountering any obstacles.

The two-bar hypermeter is usually marked well enough to prevail despite the frequent intervention of both metrical displacement and nonperiodic grouping. Unlike later hypermeter, which operates in concert with a large and systemic periodic grid and consequently retains the support of a more or less congruent grouping structure, Baroque hypermeter is defined only by a very local grid and by a very local grouping structure, with which it does not usually coincide exactly.<sup>73</sup> A larger grid may or may not emerge in the course of the piece. Because the support of the grid is tentative and because the grouping patterns that define the grid change as the piece proceeds, the two-bar hypermeter may well drop out from time to time, but in general it will return sooner or

---

<sup>73</sup>In chapter 2 we shall have ample opportunity to observe the surprisingly harmonious relation between a periodic and hypermetric grid on the one hand and a displaced grouping structure on the other.

later.<sup>74</sup>

Even when four-bar, six-bar, and eight-bar grouping establishes itself in stages over the span of an entire movement, as it sometimes does in Handel's larger orchestral works, thematic parallelisms similar to those that obtain between Handel's ubiquitous two-bar groups do not usually materialize. The longer groups simply follow each other in additive fashion, drawing broad but not thematic parallelisms among themselves as they go along. No single large group greater than the four-bar subphrase dominates for long. Consequently, a genuine periodic and hypermetrical grid, in the later eighteenth-century sense, crystallizes only in light orchestral dance movements and in pieces where its gradual establishment is among the guiding strategic ideas of the piece. More often than not, there is little to be gained from reducing even these quasi-periodic works by a factor larger than two.

The value of a reduction by two lies, among other things, in its comprehensive portrayal of the composition's pacing structure. To a greater extent than a simple rhythmic reduction in real time it forces us to leave out ancillary voice leading and to restore the original time span of the basic progressions that remain in the picture. Example 9, from the Allemande of the C-minor Concerto Grosso, Op. 6 No. 8, illustrates with considerable clarity how the Allemande's four-to-the-bar, quarter-note basic pace has been temporarily expanded to a two-to-the-bar half-note basic pace. Thanks to the reduction, the expanded but veiled half-note movement emerges as a clearly visible, easily apprehended, and perfectly straightforward movement in quarter notes.

I shall discuss three-bar grouping, three-bar hypermeter, and the durational reduction of triple groupings as examples present themselves, and in chapter 3.

---

<sup>74</sup>L & J 1983 and Rothstein 1989 observe that hypermeter and grouping need not be absolutely congruent to support each other.

*Rhythmic reduction and pace reduction.* For all the sophistication of durational reduction, a simple rhythmic reduction of a Handelian piece—a *pace reduction* as I call it—usually illustrates the specific point I try to bring across as efficiently as a durational reduction, and perhaps even more clearly. The reason is that a rhythmic reduction introduces only modest alterations to the fundamental and immediately recognizable temporal picture of the piece. Durational reduction, in contrast—even a reduction by a factor of two—can run the risk of altering that picture quite drastically because it leaves out many layers of familiar note values and because it adds new layers of small note values that are not in the notated score. It is in order to forestall the intrusive preponderance of such alterations and additions that I adopt a very conservative style of plain rhythmic reduction in most of the analyses I offer here. Whenever possible, in fact, I provide a straightforward pace reduction rather than a durational reduction, and I show the presence of hypermeasures through the alternation of large and small barlines.

*Pace and normalization.* Despite their conservative scale, the reductions I offer show the unmistakable influence of Carl Schachter's trilogy of essays, "Rhythm and Linear Analysis."<sup>75</sup> The emphasis the reductions throw on the restoration of the underlying progressions' time spans, however, derives from William Rothstein's doctoral dissertation, "Rhythm and the Theory of Structural Levels," and from Rothstein's later article, "Rhythmic Displacement and Rhythmic Normalization."<sup>76</sup> In these pioneering studies Rothstein presents an explicit formulation of fundamental durational principles that are implicit in Schenker's theory of voice-leading levels. Taking his cue from J. J. Fux's *Gradus ad Parnassum*, Rothstein demonstrates how the suspension in fourth-species counterpoint can be reduced out and replaced at a deeper level by the fundamentally

---

<sup>75</sup>Schachter 1976, 1980, and 1987, all reprinted in Schachter 1999b.

<sup>76</sup>Rothstein 1981 and 1990b.



longer tone to which it resolves—the tone whose duration the suspension abbreviates in the foreground. The removal of the suspension restores the tone of resolution's underlying time span and in effect converts the fourth-species progression into a more skeletal first-species exercise (Example 10a). Taking another cue—this time from Schenker—Rothstein goes on to apply the same principle to the reduction and removal of ancillary voice leading in free composition, and to the subsequent replacement of the ancillary voice leading by a more basic tonal and rhythmic progression (Example 10b). The restoration of the underlying progression's proper time-span is the procedure Rothstein calls normalization.

I employ this same procedure of replacement and normalization to uncover the slower underlying movement of the basic pace and its fluctuations. The straightforward pace reduction I use allows us to observe the plastic alteration of the basic pace through the intervention of faster progressions, ancillary voice leading, and sequential expansions at the surface. By way of introduction to this reductive apparatus, compare the three levels in Example 11: Observe how the reduction at levels b and c (which I explain in detail in the next section) distills the expanded two-bar movement of the basic pace from the thickets of the solo organ's busy figurations.

*The notation of reduction.* Where only short and straightforward progressions are involved I usually remove ornamental and ancillary tones and chords altogether. When reducing longer and more complex progressions, though—the traversal through falling fifths in Example 11, for instance—I retain the ancillary voice leading but place it in parentheses of various sizes to show which chords do and which chords do not take part in the pace structure at a given level. The line extending through the parentheses to the downbeat of the next measure indicates the subservience of the voice leading inside the parentheses to the chord that appears on the following downbeat. Conversely, a line extending in similar

fashion back from the material in the parentheses to an earlier chord indicates subservience to that earlier chord.

Example 11b demonstrates how I use small parentheses within the system to point to ancillary material that will eventually be reduced out in the course of a multi-level pace reduction. The parentheses are small because they contain music which—at the level I've chosen for the reduction—must still be included in the representation of the principal voice leading. (In other words, despite the reduction and despite the parentheses the material enclosed by the parentheses continues to retain its full durational value.) A metrical or hypermetrical parsing of the passage as reduced in Example 11b therefore comes out to four bars at an expanded two-bar basic pace.

The corresponding reduction in Example 11c, by contrast, takes place at a deeper level and employs larger parentheses. Its large parentheses embrace the entire system, and they disclose that the ancillary material has now been effectively reduced out. Though still provided by the notation (as a courtesy of sorts), the ancillary material no longer retains its durational value: It is no longer included in the parsing of the passage, which now comes out to two bars at an underlying one-bar basic pace.

Some analysts would probably want to leave out the ancillary material enclosed by these large parentheses in Example 11c altogether, and to replace it with more fundamental voice leading that has been restored to its original time span through the process of normalization. I am thinking especially of Fred Lerdahl and Ray Jackendoff, whose imaginary reduction of Example 11 I have provided in Example 12. I find that the removal of so much material during reduction goes too far in altering the sound picture of the piece. To the extent that it is possible, I prefer to retain the reduced-out material within the large parentheses in order to let the reduction represent more faithfully the aural and the visual image of the densely contrapuntal foreground. As it is, the texture of Example 11a has already been quite considerably trimmed and thinned out through plain

contrapuntal and rhythmic reduction. Any additional normalization would only follow the law of diminishing returns and would loosen the ties between the reduction and the original score beyond what one can readily recognize and hear. Occasions do of course arise, especially in the richly textured orchestral repertoire, where it is necessary to dispense with the entirety of the ancillary material, however substantial such material might be, and to replace it with a simple fundamental progression. Even then, however, a basic faithfulness to the larger aural and visual image of the foreground must remain an essential ideal of the reduction.

Deciding what to keep and what to leave out is a more difficult matter than it appears to be—certainly more difficult than it is when reducing later music—because the reduction must take into account the long-range significance of fast-moving and chordally packed counterpoint. Even a preliminary contrapuntal reduction requires a good deal of analytical—and ultimately subjective—interpretation. The difficulties of reducing Handel's music are compounded by Handel's tendency to change textures without warning, and to alter the long-range significance of a passage upon repetition. They are made more challenging still by Handel's constant alternation between the assignment of plain doublings and the assignment of more essential tones to the inner voices. Even when a three-voice framework clearly underlies the prevailing texture and a four-voice texture predominates just under the foreground, Handel's unpredictable sound picture does not lend itself well to systematic reduction. At the risk of improvising in diverse ways, I have opted for tackling each voice-leading and metrical situation on a case-by-case basis instead of adopting a rigid set of reductive guidelines.<sup>77</sup>

*Terminology.* It will have become evident to the reader by now that I have had to coin

---

<sup>77</sup>Renwick 1995a and Wen 1999 offer particularly good accounts of the difficulties one encounters when reducing Baroque textures vis-à-vis the fine distinction between voices, parts, and their numbers at various levels of structure.

quite a number of new terms in order to articulate my ideas succinctly throughout the dissertation, above all in chapters 1 and 2. The meaning of these terms—the *basic pace*, the *principal grouping pace*, and their companions—should become clear as I put them to empirical use. To help the reader, though, I have provided an extensive Glossary at the end of the text. Ongoing consultation with this Glossary will, I hope, resolve any uncertainties the reader might face upon encountering these unfamiliar appellations.

## II. Theoretical issues.

Under ideal circumstances it might be possible to offer a complete tonal analysis along with every durational analysis and rhetorical interpretation, but limitations of space and the need to focus on pacing and expansion as the dissertation's essential topics render this desirable course of action impracticable. Unlike the highly prolongational manner of the Classic and Romantic styles, the contrapuntal fabric of the Baroque does not lend itself well to the kind of drastic tonal reduction that is required at the deeper levels of structure (even though such a reduction might reveal an alternative *Ursatz* form quite clearly). Truly valuable voice-leading sketches of early eighteenth-century music tend to be very extended and very elaborately detailed, and they require equally elaborate commentary and explanation. Consequently there are practical limits to the number of such sketches that can be accommodated in any piece of research, especially one that deals primarily with durational issues. With these limits in mind, I offer voice-leading sketches and comments only when they contribute directly to the durational or thematic discourse, and only at the level most appropriate to the discussion.

*Eighteenth-century theory.* Of the many influential eighteenth-century treatises on composition, none has greater relevance for the study of early eighteenth-century meter

and rhythm than Johann Philipp Kirnberger's *Die Kunst des reinen Satzes in der Musik* ("The Art of Strict Musical Composition").<sup>78</sup> Despite its late date, it documents quite faithfully the compositional practice of J. S. Bach and his orbit.<sup>79</sup> Particularly valuable are Kirnberger's detailed account of each time signature's distinct character, and especially his outline of the differences between the three types of 4/4 time. Kirnberger provides ample documentation that during the eighteenth century a time signature—like meter itself—conveyed much more than just the hierarchical arrangement of the metrical grid within each measure. In chapters 2 and 3 I make extensive use of Kirnberger's description of the various meters, and of his invaluable division of grouping spans into segments, phrases, and periods.<sup>80</sup>

Many different kinds of expansion—especially those that procure long stretches of music from relatively short segments—are described in encyclopedic fashion by Johann Georg Riepel and Heinrich Christoph Koch in a pair of seminal treatises, Riepel's *Anfangsgründe zur musikalischen Setzkunst* and Koch's *Versuch einer Einleitung zur Composition*.<sup>81</sup> Even though the mechanisms for expansion described in each work show a high degree of applicability to the present study, I refer to them only infrequently: My relatively narrow focus on the large tonal context in which several very specific types of expansion take place and on the rhetorical circumstances under which they evolve precludes repeated reference to the procedures that Riepel and Koch describe so

---

<sup>78</sup>Kirnberger 1776-79/1982.

<sup>79</sup>Even though Kirnberger is more thoroughly periodic in his outlook than Bach, in keeping with the later stylistic norms of his day.

<sup>80</sup>There are many fine summaries of and commentaries on Kirnberger's foundational metrical observations. In terms of the issues I address here, Grave 1985 is certainly the most helpful. Henneberg 1974, Schwindt-Gross 1989, and Maurer Zenck 2001 are also valuable.

<sup>81</sup>Riepel 1752-1768, Koch 1782-93/1983.

exhaustively.<sup>82</sup> As it happens, several substantial publications that explicate the two treatises have appeared in recent years, and they embody some of the most comprehensive work in present-day music scholarship.<sup>83</sup> Their ready availability lessens the need for frequent reference to the work of either theorist.

*Hidden repetition and enlargement.* The study of hidden repetition and long-range thematic enlargement from a Schenkerian point of view is essential to the study of Handelian phrase rhythm: The enlargements of the upbeat motive  $c^2-a=^1$  in the F-minor Allemande (Examples 2 and 3) disclose as much. But again, analytical work in this area has ranged so widely in recent years that its copious citation has become largely superfluous.<sup>84</sup>

*The three-part ritornello.* Among the most important theoretical formulations of twentieth-century musicology—one whose significance far transcends the purely descriptive use to which it was originally put—is Wilhelm Fischer's division of the opening ritornello in a concerto movement into an expository *Vordersatz*, a developmental *Fortspinnung*, and a cadential *Epilog*.<sup>85</sup> The great value of this division, which has recently been put to many different uses by musicologists and theorists alike, resides in its concise description of the thematic and tonal roles played by each of the

---

<sup>82</sup>Sisman 1982 and Rothstein 1989 make good empirical use of Koch's observations; Braunschweig 1997 offers an indispensable comprehensive overview.

<sup>83</sup>Baker 1976, 1977, 1980 and 1988, Reed 1983, Knouse 1986, London 1990a, 1990b, and 1990c, and Christensen and Baker 1995. (Reed and Knouse are the same person: Nola Jane Reed and Nola Reed Knouse.)

<sup>84</sup>Burkhart 1978, Kamien 1983b, and Larson 1994 and 1997/98 are the most pertinent to the present study.

<sup>85</sup>Fischer 1915.

three parts, on several levels of formal structure and across several spans of time. The cycle of *Vordersatz*, *Fortspinnung*, and *Epilog* and its many variants can extend, concurrently, over stretches that vary from four and eight measures to a complete, through-composed movement. The roles performed by the three parts and the dialectics between them are consequently enacted on a much larger scale and in ways far more complex than their simple tripartite outline—or Fischer's original conception of it—would seem to suggest.<sup>86</sup> The ritornello scheme underlies many genres outside of the solo concerto: Without intervening episodes, for instance, it predominates in each reprise of the allemandes, the courantes, and the giges of most Baroque keyboard suites. Knowledge of the ritornello's paradigmatic design therefore presents us with a powerful analytical tool, the more so when one or more of the ritornello's three parts is extended, repeated, elided, or displaced from its familiar and expected location.<sup>87</sup> I shall discuss the hierarchic representation of ritornello structure in the F-minor Allemande in chapter 1. For now, a paradigmatic example may suffice—the opening ritornello from the B= Concerto, Op. 4, No. 6 (Example 8). Handel's elfin theme illustrates very well how a two-bar segment is introduced by the *Vordersatz*, developed by the *Fortspinnung*, and closed off by the two-bar *Epilog*. The *Epilog*, which often confirms a temporary tonicization of

---

<sup>86</sup>Wayne C. Petty (1995a) has called attention to a limitation, frequently overlooked, built into Fischer's original conception: Fischer set out to describe only the thematic behavior of the ritornello's three parts, not the behavior of their bass line. Later theorists and musicologists have made amends, though, and again to such a degree that repeated citation of their work is not necessary. Marissen 1990-1995, Petty 1995a, Everett 1996, and especially Dreyfus 1996 have had the most substantial influence on my work.

<sup>87</sup>Marissen and Dreyfus, throughout the various books and essays I have listed in the bibliography, note similar elisions and reversals. Caplin 1998 finds an analogous play among the three parts of Schoenberg's sentence structure throughout the Viennese Classical repertoire. (The three-part ritornello and three-part sentence are closely related; I discuss the relationship in detail, with further references, in Willner 1999.) The literature on Bach's vocal music is now replete with studies of Bach's hierarchic and recombinatory treatment of ritornello structure in his cantatas. See, for instance, Crist 1971, Dürr 1971, Dubowy 1991, and Lee 1993.

the dominant suggested by the two earlier parts, serves here only to stabilize a temporary, back-relating V. How ironic, then, that it does little to alleviate the tonal complexities of the earlier segments (Example 8b): These include invertible counterpoint, a continual exchange of parts, a partially submerged three-part *Ursatz*, and a hazy borderline between tonic and dominant. Indeed, within such an unexpectedly dense context, Handel's light textures and feather-weight recorder accompaniments acquire the quality of a private joke.

*Ritornello, expansion, and continuity.* Formal duties aside, the tripartite ritornello cycle also embodies a three-part pacing and grouping structure whose durational tensions call for sustained elaboration and resolution in the course of the piece. Each of the ritornello's three parts displays durational properties all its own, and these in turn affect both the phrase rhythm and the rhetorical structure of the composition. The principal forum for working out the rhythmic potential of the three parts is the network of enlargements I described earlier. The link between ritornello and enlargement is a natural one because the identifying durational features of the three parts can be worked out on various levels of durational structure (chapters 1, 4, and 5).

It is by no means unusual for several ritornello cycles that vary in content, length, and scale to appear nested one within the other. Such multi-level nesting is made possible by the strong functional identity that the ritornello's three parts maintain across even a complete movement: A single, discrete ritornello typically represents just the *Vordersatz*, the *Fortspinnung*, or the *Epilog* of a longer, larger ritornello.

I use the word "cycle" to describe the three-part ritornello, and with good reason. Because three-part ritornellos usually appear in groups, the *Epilog* often retains an open-ended quality despite the cadence with which it closes. Especially in solo works, the *Epilog* might substitute an imperfect authentic or a deceptive cadence for the expected



perfect cadence, or else it might close with a drastic elision or overlap (yielding its original cadential thrust to the larger requirements of the piece). The string of ritornellos so joined soon acquires a distinctly cyclic or strophic quality. Instead of emphasizing segmentation and partitioning, they are most likely to throw their weight behind the even flow and the continuity of the whole.

### III. Baroque pacing in a wider context

*Applicability to the repertoire.* My focus on Handel's instrumental music notwithstanding, many of the conclusions I reach can be applied without changes also to the music of Bach and Scarlatti.<sup>88</sup> I mentioned earlier that some adjustments would be necessary in order to apply my findings to the music of the middle style. Most of these adjustments have to do with pace, since the music of the high style relies on the basic pace and follows the principles of first and fourth species counterpoint, while the music of the middle style relies on composite pacing and follows the principles of fifth species writ large. The composers of the middle style—Couperin, Rameau, Vivaldi, and Telemann in particular—consequently enjoy a freedom in their choice and arrangement of themes, rhythms, and textures that is not available to the composers of the high style. The contrapuntal orientation of even pacing that marks the high style is simply not among the middle style's top priorities; the natural, tasteful, and sometimes capricious flow of events is. Their music bespeaks a preference for rhythmic plasticity and for free-flowing invention that allows for a comparatively unfettered durational expression.

From our organicist perspective the middle style's valorization of ever-changing invention is perhaps a breach of compositional decorum. But from the practical and often

---

<sup>88</sup>Willner 2000 explores their application to the Scarlatti sonatas; Sutcliffe 2003, the most substantial study of the sonatas, eschews such application in favor of ad-hoc analytical observations.

utilitarian perspective of the middle style itself—the need to procure concertos for Sunday orphanage concerts or to supply music that could be played, at least conceptually, at the dinner table—the middle style's musical ethos embodies a set of artistic ideals all its own. When Handel and Bach borrowed from this repertoire they changed its paces and its rhythms as needed. When we borrow the durational apparatus we apply analytically to their music and use it to untangle the complexities of the middle style, we must do likewise and change the paces and rhythms of our apparatus as needed.<sup>89</sup>

### III. Parameters of study

*Practical limitations.* In the interest of keeping the scale of the dissertation to a reasonably manageable size, I have restricted the repertoire it covers to Handel's instrumental works and, within that broad framework, to his keyboard works on the one hand and to the *Concerti Grossi*, Op. 6, the organ concertos, Op. 4 and Op. 7, and several other concerted works on the other. My focus on instrumental music stems from the tonal and durational differences that were maintained between the instrumental and vocal repertoires during the Baroque era. These differences had to do with the strengths and the weaknesses of each performing medium; so wide were they that they took up an entire chapter in Johann Mattheson's *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*.<sup>90</sup> Many features of Baroque vocal style lend it the quality of an exclusive language, one that does not translate at all well into instrumental discourse: the restricted thematic and registral tessitura of the vocal line, the deployment of extensive repetition to accommodate the effective as well as the affective setting of the text, and the frequent adjustment of pacing to the declamatory

---

<sup>89</sup>I show how this might be done, at some length, in Willner 2004.

<sup>90</sup>Mattheson 1739/1981, chapter 12.

and emotional requirements of the text. Vocal style, in other words, operates under structural and durational conditions fundamentally different from those that prevail in instrumental works. A full-length study would be needed to deal adequately with its highly specific complexities, and especially with the tendency of a single affect, usually announced by an aria's opening thematic gesture, to dominate the entire aria and to hold the reins on its otherwise flexible phrase rhythm.<sup>91</sup>

The restriction to keyboard suites and to concertos (with only an occasional excursion to a chamber sonata or an orchestral suite) is due to the differences in the kinds of expansion one finds in the solo and in the orchestral works. Because the expansions differ so much it is necessary to treat each medium separately and in considerable detail (chapter 1) before taking on the structural and rhetorical features common to both (chapters 2 and 3). Expansion in the solo works usually comes about through fluctuations in the basic pace (recall Example 2) and over time it inches ever more closely toward purely tonal expansion. Expansion in the orchestral works is geared to a much greater degree on the enlargement of grouping structures and on the realization of periodic frameworks.

It so happens that concentrating on Handel's keyboard suites and on his concertos has an extra stylistic advantage. The eight keyboard suites Handel published in 1720 were composed or revised largely between 1715 and 1720: They reflect the state of temporality and phrase rhythm in the early decades of the eighteenth century, at the apex of the high Baroque. The organ concertos and the orchestral concertos, by contrast, date from about 1735 to 1750: They show the exquisitely filtered influence of the galant style

---

<sup>91</sup>The gestural quality of vocal music, too, is largely absent from the instrumental repertoire of the Baroque, where (at least in the high style) an elegant rhythmic flow is always at a premium. Sacred vocal music shows additional complexities, such as slow-moving *cantus firmi*, which one rarely encounters elsewhere. Among the few Baroque composers who wrote gestural instrumental music was Domenico Scarlatti; that explains, in part, why his sonatas are so difficult to analyze (see Sutcliffe 2003).

and Domenico Scarlatti's keyboard manner mixed in with the stylized recollection of the Italianate solo concerto, the French character piece, the cosmopolitan Viennese keyboard suite, and the Corellian concerto grosso, all held together by the linear ideals of North German counterpoint.<sup>92</sup> As we shuttle between Handel's suites and his concertos, then, we shall be covering a wide range of styles, genres, and repertoires indeed, even if the number of the detailed analyses we'll be going through will of necessity remain small. The chamber works and the orchestral pieces that will receive only occasional consideration here—the solo sonatas, Op. 1, the trio sonatas, Op. 2 and Op. 5 (most of them chamber arrangements of orchestral works), the Concerti Grossi, Op. 3, the Concerti a due cori, the Water Music, and the Music for the Royal Fireworks—these can all be interpreted from the perspectives established here, with adjustments made for the lighter movements that embrace the ways of the middle style. I have in any event dealt with this substantial repertoire in some of my published works.<sup>93</sup>

*Form and genre.* Conspicuously absent from the present study is a detailed treatment of matters relating to large-scale form and genre other than the three-part ritornello cycle. Although Handel's improvisatory approach is conditioned by the standard outlines and procedures of binary, ternary, and through-composed forms, Handel's treatment of these forms requires a separate study for its elucidation. Such a study would have to take into account the recent proliferation of interdisciplinary genre studies. For now, Laurence Dreyfus's work on genre in Bach's instrumental works and Robert Hatten's work on the

---

<sup>92</sup>Best 2004 emphasizes the orthodox German quality of Handel's solo keyboard works. I thank Terence Best for making this article available to me before its publication.

<sup>93</sup>In Willner 1991 I present an analysis of the Passacaille theme from the Trio Sonata in G, Op. 5, No. 4. In Willner 1999 I discuss pacing and expansion in the Menuet from the F-major Concerto Grosso, Op. 3, No. 4, and in the Overture from the Music for the Royal Fireworks.

markedness of stylistic levels in Beethoven will provide us with enough by way of a theoretical framework to lean on.<sup>94</sup> Writing from a Schenkerian perspective, I have already pointed to the direction that Baroque genre studies might follow in "Bach's Periodicities Re-Examined" and in "Handel, the Sarabande, and Levels of Genre."<sup>95</sup>

*Meter.* Most of the weighty and complex movements in Handel's instrumental works are set in the large, the simple, and the compound 4/4, or else in 3/4 time. Since one of my principal tasks is to demonstrate how we might go about interpreting such difficult and challenging movements, I confine the discussion in chapters 1, 4, and 5—my principal analytical chapters—to pieces in 3/4 and 4/4 time. I do include pieces composed in other meters in chapters 2 and 3, which focus on matters of theory and style. Also, I confine the range of pieces I present in chapters 1, 4, and 5 to compositions in tempo giusto: Handel's slow movements, beautiful and substantial though they are, don't usually present the kind of stylistic and interpretative challenge that their faster companions do, and they occupy, on the whole, a relatively small proportion of Handel's instrumental output. I do, however, offer complete analyses of several slow movements in 3/2 time at the end of chapter 3.

*Editions.* A number of reliable editions of Handel's instrumental works are now available, but I have prepared the quotations from Handel's music in consultation with the original sources: the 1720 edition of the eight keyboard suites, published by John Cluer on Handel's behalf and under Handel's supervision, and the autograph manuscripts, housed in the British Library, of the Concerti Grossi, Op. 6, and the organ concertos, Op. 4 and Op. 7. A copy of the Cluer edition is owned by the Music Division of the New York Public

---

<sup>94</sup>Dreyfus 1996 and Hatten 1994.

<sup>95</sup>Willner 1996b and 1996d.

Library for the Performing Arts, Special Collections (classmark: Drexel 5855), and microfilms of the British Library manuscripts are available at the Music Division as well. I have tried to follow a similar editorial practice in my quotations from other composers as well, but I hasten to add that in all my quotations the interpretative use I have made of these various and sometimes conflicting resources remains necessarily my own.

Since most of the pieces I discuss are well known and belong to Handel's most familiar collections of instrumental works, I do not use the HWV (*Händel Werke-Verzeichnis*) numbers set up by Bernd Baselt in the *Händel-Handbuch*.<sup>96</sup> The commonly used designations established empirically over the years are more readily familiar to most readers than these recent HWV numbers, and their citation remains more efficient and more user-friendly as well.

*Pitch designations.* In referring to upper-voice and to inner-voice pitches above middle C I use the standard range of  $c^1$ - $b^1$  to designate pitches in the one-line octave,  $c^2$ - $b^2$  to designate pitches in the two-line octave, and so on. In referring to the bass line and to inner-voice pitches below middle C, however, I often employ only capital letters since within these voices many tones often change their established or their expected register in the course of a single passage; see for instance the bass line in bars 5-6 of the F-minor Allemande in Example 1. A stepwise bass line in high Baroque style typically allocates some of its tones to the small octave and some of them to the great octave, shifting seamlessly between the two octaves and making additional excursions into the one-line octave when the opportunity presents itself.<sup>97</sup> It will also leave quite a number of its tones implicit. Under the circumstances, referring to specific bass pitches and to specific

---

<sup>96</sup>Baselt 1986.

<sup>97</sup>The *bassetti* accompaniments of the Venetian concerto repertoire represent the most extreme and most stylized extension of this phenomenon.

inner-voice pitches in the vicinity of the bass will only encumber the discussion of the composition's underlying stepwise structure. With few exceptions, adjectival designations such as "bass" or "inner voice" before a pitch or before a series of pitches in capital letters should make it abundantly clear to what register the discussion refers.

*Publications and presentations.* During the past few years I have had the opportunity to present some of my theoretical and analytical formulations in published articles as well as unpublished conference papers. Most of the observations I offered in those early projects could not be incorporated here for practical considerations of space and for reasons of focus and scope. I have, in any case, made a concerted effort not to repeat in these pages what I have already made available in print. My publications and conference papers should therefore be viewed as supporting and complementing—not as overlapping or duplicating—the present study. I consequently rely on the reader's access to my published works in the same way that I rely on the availability of any other scholar's published work. In the order of their relevance to the present study, they are,

1. "Baroque Styles and the Analysis of Baroque Music" (Willner 2004)
2. "Sequential Expansion and Handelian Phrase Rhythm" (Willner 1999)
3. "Stress and Counterstress: Accentual Conflict and Reconciliation in J.S. Bach's Instrumental Works" (1998)
4. "Bach's Periodicities Re-Examined" (1996b)
5. "Analysis and Interpretation in the Performance of Handel's Concerti Grossi, Op. 6" (1989)
6. "The Two-Length Bar Revisited: Handel and the Hemiola" (1991)
7. "More on Handel and the Hemiola: Overlapping Hemiolas" (1996e)
8. "Handel, the Sarabande, and Levels of Genre: A Reply to David Schulenberg" (1996d)

9. "Handel's Borrowings from Telemann: An Analytical View" (1990)
10. "Chromaticism and the Mediant in Four Late Haydn Works" (1988)
11. "Beethoven and Handel: The Significance of a Borrowing" (1996c)
12. "Austrian Collections in the New York Public Library: Heinrich Schenker's Manuscripts in the Oster Collection" (on Schenker's analysis of the Sarabande from Bach's E-minor English Suite) (1996a)<sup>98</sup>

I shall occasionally refer also to three unpublished papers, "Nascent Periodicity and Bach's Progressive *Galanterien*" (1992), "Sequential Expansion and Baroque Phrase Rhythm" (1995b), "Adjacency and Counterstress: Applying Durational Reduction to Baroque Music" (1995a), and "Domenico Scarlatti and the Hidden Voice Exchange" (2000), which I read at various conferences. "Nascent Periodicity" is reproduced in the Appendix as read (along with the original footnotes) since I cite some of its basic ideas from time to time.

*Other dissertations and publications.* My basic approach and the conclusions I reach bear occasional similarity to ideas expressed in Frank Samarotto's dissertation, "A Theory of Temporal Plasticity in Tonal Music" (Samarotto 1999b). Although I did not read Samarotto's dissertation before it was completed, I had heard several related papers that he presented at informal gatherings and scholarly meetings, including "Metrical Ambiguity in Bach: Did Bach Know What a Downbeat Is" (1985), "Temporal Disjunction in Beethoven's Op. 109, First Movement" (1996), "Representing Rhythmic Diversity" (1995), and "Strange Dimensions: Regularity and Irregularity in Deep Levels of Rhythmic Reduction" (1992/1999a). Conversely, although Samarotto has not seen the present

---

<sup>98</sup>Nos. 11 and 12, that is Willner 1996a and 1996c, presented at the Millennium Conference, Ottawa, were to have been published in the conference proceedings, but the proceedings never got off the ground. I hope to have them published elsewhere soon.



dissertation, he has had access to my initial work on it and to my unpublished conference papers, many of whose handouts he set to type with great elegance. Samarotto's work presents significant insights into the behavior of tonal rhythm and its articulation at the deeper levels of structure, especially during the emergence of the Romantic era, and it introduces important new ideas about Beethoven's phrase rhythm. The substantial differences between the repertoires on which our dissertations are based and between the rhythmic problems particular to each era ensure that no genuine overlaps obtain in the results of our research.

Along the same lines, occasional similarities inevitably emerge between my analytical formulations and Wayne C. Petty's observations on form, rhetoric, and voice leading in his dissertation, "Compositional Techniques in the Keyboard Sonatas of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach: Reimagining the Foundations of a Musical Style" (Petty 1995a), which I also read after I had completed most of my work.<sup>99</sup> In the course of the early 1990s I heard Petty deliver several remarkable papers, including "C.P.E. Bach and the Fine Art of Transposition" (Petty 1992 and 1999), "Koch, Schenker, and the Development Section of Early Sonata Forms" (1993), and "Motivic Modulation" (1995b). The points of contact between our dissertations reside mainly in our common approach to the repetition and enlargement of Wilhelm Fischer's three-part ritornello scheme, and in our common approach to the guiding compositional idea, the crux of what I call the rhetorical structure. Again, differences in style, repertoire, and especially in degrees of emphasis on tonal and durational matters help forestall any real duplication of effort.

Further along these same lines, similarities have surfaced between my theoretical formulation of Handel's metrical displacements and Ido Abravaya's widely encompassing

---

<sup>99</sup>I thank Wayne C. Petty for donating a copy of his dissertation to the Music Division of the New York Public Library.

historical formulation of Bach’s displacements, which he presents in his magisterial dissertation, “Studies of Rhythm and Tempo in the Music of J.S. Bach” (Abravaya 1999), a dissertation that I read well after my dissertation was complete.<sup>100</sup> With great erudition and striking elegance, Abravaya recounts the history of upbeat and afterbeat idioms from the Renaissance to Chopin, emphasizing Bach’s instrumental music but including also examples from Handel’s and Couperin’s. As it happens, the points of contact between our works do include several identical examples, including Handel’s Harmonious Blacksmith air and Couperin’s “Les Regrets.” But since our approaches are so different—there are few tonal or durational reductions in Abravaya’s dissertation—our efforts complement rather than duplicate one another.<sup>101</sup>

And still further along these very same lines, there are some conceptual if not methodological similarities between my approach to displacement and Harald Krebs’s, which are laid out in his wonderful book, *Fantasy Pieces: Metrical Dissonance in the Music of Robert Schumann* (Krebs 1999). The book appeared well after I had formulated my approach and wrote it out. Since I focus on the idiomatic regularity of displacement as an identifying marker of various Baroque meters, while Krebs presents an account of displacement as an idiosyncratic (if consistent) feature of Romantic phrase rhythm, the similarity between the two works is more apparent than it is real.

\* \* \*

---

<sup>100</sup>I thank Ido Abravaya, too, for donating a copy of his dissertation to the Music Division of the New York Public Library. The dissertation, which was written in English, is to be published by Bärenreiter, in the original English, soon.

<sup>101</sup>It proved unwieldy as well as textually disruptive to document each point of contact systematically. By the same token, the Bärenreiter edition of Abravaya’s work will contain few direct references to my work.

In this Introduction I have dwelt largely on the fundamentals of pacing, rhetoric, and style analysis, and I surveyed briefly the historical, theoretical, and analytical literature about several fundamental issues in Baroque studies, as well as the study of phrase rhythm and the study of Handel's borrowings. If I kept my bibliographic observations short and didn't write much about Handel scholarship, or about the voluminous Handelian literature of the past few decades, that is because very little of this work has any bearing on the analytical matters under consideration here. Handel scholars have quite understandably occupied themselves with sorting out the vast font of Handelian source materials—the goldmine of borrowings and the treasure trove of autograph manuscripts—in preparation for the ongoing publication of the *Hallsche Händel-Ausgabe*. In the absence of truly reliable editions of Handel's vocal music, the completion of this new edition inevitably remains their top priority. Because the quantity and the complexity of Handel's manuscripts is unrivaled by the legacy of any other major composer, Handelians have only very rarely ventured away from the study of the sources; few have attempted any kind of analysis of the music itself.<sup>102</sup>

All told there is little in Baroque research that shows the kind of theoretical and historical fusion embodied in Wayne C. Petty's dissertation or in Eugene K. Wolf's pioneering studies of the Stamitz symphonies and the evolution of the Mannheim style.<sup>103</sup> In the present dissertation, I hope to start filling in this lacuna.

---

<sup>102</sup>Bach scholars, it is true, have indeed taken up rhythmic issues in Bach's music, but with few exceptions they have focused in highly mechanical ways on matters of large-scale proportion that show little relevance to the present work (see, for instance, Benary 1958). Proportional studies typically ignore the existence of structural levels: Their authors mistakenly assume that the contents of any one measure are equal in significance to the contents of any other measure in the piece. A basic assumption of this sort undermines the value of such studies from the very start (Willner 1996b and 1998). I have nonetheless relied quite substantially on the Bach literature in what concerns matters of form and genre (i.e. Dreyfus, Marissen, etc.), since Bach, like Handel, was a practitioner of the high style as well as, up to a point, the orthodox North German style.

<sup>103</sup>Petty 1995a; Wolf 1980 and 1981.